

Research Article

Initiative in Active Representative Bureaucracy: Woman Leader in Nusa Tenggara Barat

Saut Gracer Sijabat*, Faza Dhora Nailufar, R. N. Afsdy Saksono

NIPA School of Administration

ORCIDSaut Gracer Sijabat: <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2679-1659>Faza Dhora Nailufar: <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1161-8685>R. N. Afsdy Saksono: <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9404-4909>**Abstract.**

The Gender Development Index in Indonesia, released by the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia in 2020, ranked West Nusa Tenggara Province as the lowest nationally. These statistical data show that West Nusa Tenggara's position nationally is still far behind other provinces in Indonesia. On the other hand, as a province led by a female Vice Governor, West Nusa Tenggara Province has a strategic role in the representation of women in the bureaucracy. Women leaders are expected to play a role in strategic issues related to the gender development index with an active representative bureaucracy. However, the active representation of women in local (provincial) government is still very small, especially in the context/situation of regions with patriarchal characteristics. Furthermore, research with phenomenological approaches/methods is still very rare. This study used phenomenological methods. The subjects of this study are female regional leaders, namely the Vice Governor of NTB Province. The data collection technique used is in-depth interviews and reviewing secondary documents that support the active representation of women in the bureaucracy in the field of education in West Nusa Tenggara Province. The data processing and analysis techniques in this study used technical narrative analysis, which was carried out in several stages such as making interview transcripts and interpreting the meaning of the information obtained by coding techniques, analyzing certain transcripts to then be classified into several themes to identify information that is by the theme and concluding meaning relevant to the research theme. The results of this study show that the importance of women's leadership initiatives to the interests of women has a huge impact on women themselves. Special needs are becoming more of a concern and are considered as important as other development priorities. This is possible with the active repression of female leaders.

Keywords: Active Representative Bureaucracy, women's participation, women's leader initiative, West Nusa Tenggara

Corresponding Author: Saut
Gracer Sijabat; email:
saut.s@stialan.ac.id

Published 21 June 2023

Publishing services provided by
Knowledge E

© Saut Gracer Sijabat et al. This article is distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution License](#), which permits unrestricted use and redistribution provided that the original author and source are credited.

Selection and Peer-review under the responsibility of the ICoGPASS Conference Committee.

OPEN ACCESS

1. BACKGROUND

Referring to the Gender Development Index in Indonesia released by the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia in 2020, placing West Nusa Tenggara Province at the lowest rank nationally. As a measure of performance comparison (ratio) between women's HDI and men's HDI, IPG calculation refers to the methodology used by UNDP to calculate the Gender Development Index (GDI) and Human Development Index (HDI). IPG is a direct measure of gender inequality in achieving human development. Not much different from the Gender Development Index, West Nusa Tenggara also ranks third lowest after West Papua and Papua in terms of the percentage of the number of Women's State Civil Apparatus. Other data shows West Nusa Tenggara is also ranked lowest nationally for the percentage of women's involvement in Parliament (1). These statistical data show that West Nusa Tenggara's position nationally is still far behind other provinces in Indonesia. On the other hand, as a province led by a female Vice Governor, West Nusa Tenggara Province has a strategic role in the representation of women in the bureaucracy.

Gender-based representative bureaucracy (focus on women's representation) has received a lot of attention and is the object of study (2–6). The study emphasizes the representation of women in staffing perspectives including women's careers (passive representative bureaucracy). Meanwhile, several studies have focused on the role of women in the bureaucracy including efforts to bring aspirations/interests of women's people/ communities (active representative bureaucracy) for example (7–12).

However, there are still very few active representative bureaucracy analyses of women in positions as leaders of local (provincial) governments, especially in regional contexts/situations with patriarchal characteristics. Men and women in local office may value different policies, create policy in different ways, and produce different policy outcomes as a result of women's underrepresentation in local politics. Women in local elected office take a different approach to policymaking, as they are more likely to report involving citizens in important decision-making processes. Women's representation in local government has the potential to influence policy outcomes. Women mayors increase municipal employment for women (13).

How representative bureaucracy theory can be used to address gender issues in governance. It contends that power structures are embedded in masculinist norms and explains why this is insufficient. Representative bureaucracy is applied as norms to all points on the gender spectrum, and a glossary of terms is provided. They use critical mass theory to explain how tipping points vary by gender category. Conscientious

representation is proposed as a means of achieving equitable representation. (14). Using critical gender theory, institutionalized gender norms can be understood as they relate to public sector decisions (15). Furthermore, research with phenomenological approaches/methods is still very rare.

Based on the background described above, this research will focus on answering the research question, how does women's participation in development depend on women's representation in the bureaucracy? The results of this study will make an important contribution to the preparation of a model of women's involvement in the formulation of development policies and programs, especially in the fields of education and health that are more partial and/or gender-sensitive.

2. RESEARCH METHODS

Referring to the purpose of the study, this study uses the phenomenology method. The phenomenological study used in this study is hermeneutic (interpretive) Phenomenology. Phenomenology is a method formulated by Schutz as a means of analyzing the inner life of the individual. The inner life is in the form of experiences of phenomena that occur called the flow of consciousness (16). The study follows Schutz's view that each individual is present in the stream of consciousness gained from everyday experience. The assumption is the existence of the reality of others mediated by a way of thinking and feeling. After that, it is reflected and passed on to the other person through his social relationships (16).

In this study, researchers used motives and motives to analyze the relationship between women's representation in the bureaucracy and public office with women's participation in development in the fields of education and health. Schutz's concept was chosen because researchers consider the approach of individual experience that produces subjective meaning suitable when used to palpate the relationship of women's participation in development to women's representation at the bureaucracy or the decision-making level.

The subjects of this study are female regional leaders, namely the Vice Governor of NTB Province from 2018 to the current year 2023. Before becoming Vice Governor, she already had political leadership experience in the East Lombok Regency parliament. The data collection technique used is in-depth interviews and reviewing secondary documents that support the active representation of women in the bureaucracy in the field of Education in West Nusa Tenggara Province.

The data processing and analysis techniques in this study use technical narrative analysis which is carried out with several stages such as making interview transcripts and interpreting the meaning of the information obtained with coding techniques, analyzing certain transcripts to then be classified into several themes to identify information that is following the theme and drawing conclusions of meaning relevant to the research theme.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The gender development index of West Nusa Tenggara Province was at the lowest position in Indonesia in 2020 (Kemen PPPA, 2021) with a value of 80.37. The achievement of IPG, which is still far from the number 100, indicates that the human development gap is already quite high between women and men in West Nusa Tenggara. However, the NTB Provincial Government is trying to catch up with the IPG in various ways, including drafting regulations that can strengthen the position of women in public roles, collaborating with NGOs and community leaders to socialize and make the community aware of the equal position between men and women that must be achieved in society.

Among the 10 regencies/ cities in NTB, the lowest gender development index classification is in East Lombok. One of the factors that cause the low IPG in East Lombok is the high population density there. The interesting thing is that however, East Lombok excels in the percentage of women's representation in bureaucracy and politics. One example is the Vice Governor of the current period a daughter from East Lombok. The medium classification is the most in West Nusa Tenggara, so the average gender development index in West Nusa Tenggara is in the moderate classification. The regencies and cities in the medium classification consist of the regencies of Central Lombok, Dompu, Bima, West Sumbawa, and Mataram City. There are three regencies and cities in West Nusa Tenggara consisting of Sumbawa Regency, North Lombok, and Bima City. West Lombok is one of the regencies in West Nusa Tenggara that has a high gender development index (IPG) compared to other regions. This is because West Lombok is closer to the center of government and the center of economic growth, so it has more or less an effect on the culture of the people there.

According to the statistics, there are still very few female leaders in the regions. According to data from 136 countries, women make up nearly 3 million (34%) of elected members in local deliberative bodies. Only two countries have reached 50%, with another 20 countries having more than 40% women in local government (17). Regional differences in women's representation in local deliberative bodies are also noted as of

January 2022: Central and Southern Asia received 41%; Europe and Northern America received 36%; Oceania received 32%; Eastern and South-Eastern Asia received 28%; Latin America and the Caribbean received 25%; Sub-Saharan Africa received 25%; and Western Asia and Northern Africa received 18%. Women leaders makeup only 16 percent of all regional leaders in Indonesia, making the position of vice governor have very broad responsibility and authority to represent the interests of women in the regions.

To make the role of women felt in the development of education in NTB Province, an important factor is the initiative of women as a form of active representation in the spirit of building. From the results of the interviews conducted with the speakers, information was obtained that the initiative is an opening for the active representation of women in the development of education in NTB. The initiative carried out by women is to create women's Musrenbang activities, and children's Musrenbang, in women and child-friendly villages. However, this initiative also needs to be supported by the involvement of other related parties, including the Ministry of PPA, DPRD as a regulator, to community elements such as NGOs and UNICEF. Musrenbang activities that have been carried out include in Lombok Utara Regency (18), Sumbawa Regency (19), Bima Regency (20).

The NTB Provincial Government also took the initiative to include the Institut Lingkaran Pendidikan Alternatif (KAPAL) in the development of a women's movement that promotes peaceful societies that promote social and gender justice, pluralism, and the abolition of violence against women. Sekolah Perempuan, which serves as a forum for informal, community-based education and training to empower poor women at the grassroots, and creates local women leaders who are able to advocate for women's rights, as well as policies and budgets that support women's access to services, are two of KAPAL Perempuan's two main programs. In 2018, the NTB Province Girls' School program was implemented in 29 villages in North Lombok Regency and 4 villages in East Lombok Regency. Aside from Sekolah Perempuan, the Gender Watch program is used to monitor government social protection programs through community-based gender audits (AGBK) to ensure beneficiary data accuracy and improve poor women's access to the National Health Insurance (JKN).

There are three villages that will be NTB Provincial Government pilot projects in the formation of a Girls' School group until 2022, including Rupe Village in Bima Regency, Campai Village in Dompu Regency, and Banda Village in Sumbawa Regency. This program's expected outcomes include improving women's quality of life, lowering the rate of violence against women and children, lowering child labor, lowering child marriage, lowering trafficking crimes, protecting and empowering women in social communication, narcotics, discrimination against women, and other social problems.

Sekolah Perempuan advocated for 26 cases in 2020. Three of them involve domestic violence, while others involve child marriage and sexual abuse. 12 cases have been completed. Sekolah Perempuan educates Sukadana women about their rights as women, such as in the case of child marriage, which is frequently legalized by custom. Furthermore, the learning curriculum is tailored to the needs of women, so that learning patterns that can be transferred from house to house allow literacy in a variety of areas, and women's participation in village development policies is taken into account.

Women's Musrenbang were previously underrepresented. The women's representatives included the village head's wife, the village secretary's wife, and the Kepala Dusun's wife. The priority regarding their interests in the PKK institution is stated in the Musrenbangdes proposal. As a result, the hopes of women in the village as a whole were never realized. Name a few of them in relation to the water tendon in Sukadana Village, which is a common complaint among residents, particularly women. During the dry season, they have trouble finding water for bathing and washing, but this is not addressed in the village development planning meeting. For years, complaints about baby scales at the posyandu in Sumbawa regency have gone unresolved.

Prior to the women's musrenbang in East Lombok District, the TOT of Technical Guidance of the Musrenbangdes was held for women, children, the disabled, and the elderly. The government must recognize the significance of this momentum. As a result, LPA Kompak officially open the TOT Bimtek Bimtek Musrenbangdes for Women, Children, Disabilities, and the Elderly on September 5, 2019 at the Lotim Regency Government Office. The importance of integration between villages, sub-districts, and districts at the time is still a top priority at the village level because the results are more tangible and easier to track. Musrenbang also being considered as more important for non-physical programs, such as poverty alleviation, the health sector, such as stunting prevention and Posyandu revitalization, disability data, and others, in order to monitor the results and future implementation. This can be seen, for example, in the slow construction of uninhabitable houses (RTLH). Despite the fact that the community desperately needs the house.

The 2022 women's Musrenbang in North Lombok Regency addressed a number of issues, including NTB having the lowest KLU Gender Development Index despite an increase from 84.01 in 2015 to 85.44 in 2020, while NTB's IPG was 90.45. North Lombok women are falling behind in education and the economy, despite the fact that women in NTB have a longer life expectancy (68.66 years) than men (64.81 years). The Covid-19 Pandemic period increased poverty in North Lombok by 0.05% in 2021, to

27.04%. Women will account for 14.46% of family heads in 2020. There are still cases of pregnant women dying (3 people in 2021).

In addition, there are 60 cases of infant mortality (both neonatal and up to one year of age) in 2021. Teenage pregnancies (19 years) have decreased, but the number remains high, with 337 cases in 2021. Childbirth at the age of 19 has also decreased, but the number remains high, with 313 cases expected in 2021. In the meantime, stunting has been reduced significantly from 44.22% in 2021. Households with Clean and Healthy Behavior are still in the minority.

In addition to initiatives and collaborations with various parties, the active representation of women in the development of education in NTB is also running because they see opportunities that are open to women. The existence of a 30% quota for women to sit in the legislature makes this initiative even bigger. Women's participation in making regional regulations makes women the opportunity to raise issues of education development in NTB has a legal force to then run as quoted by one of the speakers. Based on the interview, it was found that there is freedom for women to fill 30% of the quota of people's representatives in the DPRD the role of women in the legislature in the last 2 years, and also in the bureaucracy. This shows that there are opportunities open for women to voice their aspirations to later become legal products that support education development activities in NTB. It is critical to clarify the program's purpose, highlight its benefits for all members of an organization or community, explain how it will work, and engage leaders as active participants when launching successful women's initiatives.

This initiative and courage are also extended in line with the importance of empowerment and protection carried out by fellow women to carry out educational development. The protection in question is to overshadow the problems faced by women from wider risks and impacts and empowerment activities to strengthen the role of women's active representation as quoted from an interview with one of the speakers. Based on the results of the interview, information was obtained that the person who better understands women's problems is the woman herself so that women position themselves as observers of others who shelter, protect, and empower women so that the development goals of education can be carried out.

4. CONCLUSION

The country's attention to the development of human quality through education is an effective strategy for Indonesian human resources' intellectual and professional

development. The quality of the nation must include men and women so that both have an important role in advancing the nation, making Indonesia a strong, quality, and globally competitive country. However, education in Indonesia still has some problems due to geographical conditions, infrastructure, educational participation, qualifications of teachers and prospective students, as well as the absorption of graduates. In some regions, the education problem is still influenced by the views of people who have not placed women's education as important as men's. As a result, women are still not prioritized in obtaining access to ideal education, so they must continue to be encouraged to achieve conditions equal to men, especially at higher levels of education. Education for women is the starting point for changes in women's lives that have an impact on the progress of the wider society. The quality of women's education has a positive impact.

Bureaucracy as equal opportunity, that the bureaucracy must be able to represent the public interest and be able to formulate it into the managerial decisions it sets. The concept of representative bureaucracy suggests that a bureaucracy representative of disadvantaged groups in a society has been linked to better outcomes for those groups in a wide variety of policy areas. The amount of discretion possessed by bureaucrats, the salience of the policy area to the shared value set between the bureaucrat and represented group are some conditions under which passive representation leads to improved outcomes.

Bureaucratic representation is more effective in countries where gender equality is high and political support for gender equality is strong. Active representation, which occurs when bureaucrats share demographic characteristics with those they serve, can result in better representation of their interests. Passive representation can also lead to active representation for women in gendered policy areas such as child support. However, when women's active representation is not rewarded through identity taxation, there may be unintended consequences. These implications emphasize the importance of promoting gender equality and supporting policies that encourage both active and passive representation.

More women in positions of power and decision-making can help to achieve gender-based active representation. According to research, having more female policymakers leads to better outcomes for women. Policies and programs that empower women can also help them become more active members of their communities and society at large.

The findings of this phenomenological study on active representation of bureaucracy present several active recommendations for stakeholders, including increasing opportunities for women to actively represent women's interests in educational development

by improving women's position, role, and quality, as well as efforts to realize gender equality and justice, and strengthening representative forums for women to be heard.

Acknowledgment

We would like to express our gratitude to Nurliah Nurdin, Director of the NIPA School of Administration Polytechnic Jakarta, and our colleagues for their contributions to our participation in The Fourth International Conference on Governance, Public Administration, and Social Science (ICoGPASS). All authors made significant contributions to the methods, intellectual content of the review, as well as the writing and finalization of the manuscript. The final manuscript was read and approved by all authors.

References

- [1] KemenPPPA RI. Menteri Bintang Optimis Keterwakilan Perempuan di Legislatif Capai 30 Persen pada Pemilu 2024. 2021; Available from: <https://www.kemenpppa.go.id/index.php/page/read/29/3076/menteri-bintang-optimis-keterwakilan-perempuan-di-legislatif-capai-30-persen-pada-pemilu-2024>
- [2] Grissom JA, Nicholson-Crotty J, Nicholson-Crotty S. Race, region, and representative bureaucracy. *Pub Admin Rev.* 2009;69(5):911–919.
- [3] Jendrius J. Ayam Batino Lah Bakukuak: Otonomi Daerah dan Keterlibatan Perempuan dalam Pemerintahan Nagari di Sumatera Barat. *Kafaah: J Gender Stud.* 2011;1(2):121–136.
- [4] Nuraisyah N, Samad MA. Human resources development: Women role optimization in the local government bureaucracy in Central Sulawesi, Indonesia. *J Asian Multicult Res Econ Management Study.* 2021;2(3):61–68.
- [5] Sayrani LP. Birokrasi representasi berbasis etnik, agama dan gender dalam birokrasi Pemerintahan Propinsi Nusa Tenggara Timur. 2010.
- [6] Sipahutar NYP. Representasi Perempuan dalam Birokrasi di Pemerintah Kota Yogyakarta. 2017.
- [7] Fernandez S. Representative bureaucracy and performance: Public service transformation in South Africa. Springer; 2019.
- [8] Konisky DM. Representative bureaucrats: Attitudinal congruence and agency expertise. Unpublished article University of Missouri, Columbia. 2007.
- [9] Le Maux B. Governmental behavior in representative democracy: A synthesis of the theoretical literature. *Public Choice.* 2009;141:447–465.

- [10] Saidel JR, Loscocco K. Agency leaders, gendered institutions, and representative bureaucracy. *Pub Admin Rev.* 2005;65(2):158–170.
- [11] Sowa JE, Selden SC. Administrative discretion and active representation: An expansion of the theory of representative bureaucracy. *Pub Admin Rev.* 2003;63(6):700–710.
- [12] Theuvsen L. On good and bad bureaucracies: designing effective quality management systems in the agrofood sector. 2004.
- [13] Holman MR. Women in local government: What we know and where we go from here. *State and Local Govern Rev.* 2017 Dec 1;49(4):285–296.
- [14] Hooker J, Guy ME. Gender and representative bureaucracy. In: *Handbook on Gender and Public Administration*. Edward Elgar Publishing; 2022. p. 212–229.
- [15] Kennedy AR, Bishu SG, Heckler N. Feminism, masculinity, and active representation: A gender analysis of representative bureaucracy. *Administration & Society.* 2020 Aug 1;52(7):1101–1130.
- [16] Campbell R. Heidegger: Truth as aletheia. In: *A hundred years of phenomenology*. Routledge; 2017. p. 73–87.
- [17] UN Woman. Woman in local government [Internet]. 2022. Available from: <https://localgov.unwomen.org/>
- [18] Kementerian Agama RI. Kemenag KLU Ikuti Musrenbang Perempuan, Pemuda, Anak, Lansia dan Penyandang Disabilitas. 2021; Available from: <https://ntb.kemenag.go.id/baca/1616164800/kemenag-klu-ikuti-musrenbang-perempuan-pemuda-anak-lansia-dan-penyandang-disabilitas>
- [19] SuaraNTB.com. Musrenbang, Perkuat Pemberdayaan Perempuan Dan Penyandang Disabilitas. 2022; Available from: <https://www.suarantb.com/2022/03/19/musrenbang-perkuat-pemberdayaan-perempuan-dan-penyandang-disabilitas/>
- [20] Dutaselarang.com. Musrenbang Khusus Perempuan, Seribu Lebih Perempuan di NTB Sudah Belajar Berencana. 2020; Available from: <https://dutaselarang.com/musrenbang-khusus-perempuan-seribu-lebih-perempuan-di-ntb-sudah-belajar-berencana/>