

Conference Paper

Accessibility of Persons with Disabilities in Religion Tourism Destinations in Bangkalan District

Farida, Zulaikha, and R. Hartopo Eko Putro

Faculty of Communication, University of Dr. Soetomo, Surabaya, Indonesia

Abstract

It is the right of everyone to travel, to all tourist destinations, including religious tourism. Likewise, with persons with disabilities who have physical limitations, their right to obtain public facilities is protected under Indonesian law. However, awareness to build public facilities that are disabled-friendly is not yet the awareness of all parties.

As a regency city that has many religious tourism destinations, ideally, Bangkalan also provides facilities for people with disabilities. Moreover, although not all, many of the tourist destinations are always provided with places of worship (in this case the mosque). Persons with disabilities are also entitled to worship in places of public worship. Unfortunately, almost all religious tourism destinations and mosques in Bangkalan are not equipped with this facility.

This study tries to identify what facilities are not provided in religious tourism destinations and places of worship in the Bangkalan district. Data collected using survey methods. The results of this study are expected to be input for the Bangkalan district government to develop their area into a disability-friendly area.

Keywords: disability, destination, religious tourism

Corresponding Author:

Farida

farida@unitomo.ac.id

Published: 29 July 2020

Publishing services provided by
Knowledge E

© Farida et al. This article is distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution License](#), which permits unrestricted use and redistribution provided that the original author and source are credited.

Selection and Peer-review under the responsibility of the WCGS Conference Committee.

1. Introduction

Bangkalan Regency is an area that is synonymous with strong Islamic culture. Kyai Syaichona Cholil is believed to be an influential figure in the Bangkalan community, and his descendants have so far occupied many high positions in society, both as clerics, political figures and sitting in government at the district and provincial levels. Kyai Cholil Islamic boarding school still exists in the middle of Bangkalan with thousands of its students. The views back and forth of the students became iconic for Bangkalan himself.

Meanwhile, the tomb of the Kyai Syaichona Cholil, which is in the west of the city, is still always crowded with pilgrims who come specifically to pray for the Kyai. The tomb itself is located inside the mosque of the same name, namely the Syaichona Cholil mosque.

 OPEN ACCESS

Visiting the tombs of clerics, scholars and influential figures in Bangkalan is part of a tradition that cannot be released in the culture of Bangkalan people. Almost all the tombs of clerics, scholars and public figures visited by the community, every day for 24 hours. Not only morning or afternoon, even at midnight many people make pilgrimages to the tomb to pray.

The arrival of the people to the tombs is not only done personally or family, but also carried out by groups who ride public transportation such as buses and other large cars. Therefore, around the grave, there is always a parking lot and traders who sold their wares. The tomb then developed into crowded places and encouraged the economic growth of the surrounding community due to the growing opportunity due to the arrival of the pilgrim.

Pilgrimage and prayer activities at the tomb then developed into religious tourism. Even without promotion and reporting, people have flocked to the graves (hereinafter referred to as religious tourism destinations). Word of mouth is believed to be more effective in introducing religious tourism destinations. Usually, information dissemination is actually carried out by bus rental owners and large vehicles to transport passengers, who invite pilgrimages with the aim that the vehicle is sold.

Some of the religious tourism destinations are then built by the mosque's takmir foundation or village government, so that access to the tomb is better and easier. Some of them were built by the district government, although not yet optimal. It seems that the development of religious tourism in Bangkalan is allowed to grow just like that without the integrated development concept of the district government. The Head of Tourism and Finance in Bappeda Regency of Bangkalan even mentioned that without any promotion and development, religious tourism in Bangkalan has developed by itself, it is evident that pilgrims still always come to the religious tourism destination even though facilities and access are minimal.

With such conditions, it becomes interesting to know whether religious tourism destinations in Bangkalan can also be reached by people with disabilities. As is known, persons with disabilities also have the right to make pilgrimages, travel, pray and worship in places of public worship.

It is important to know the accessibility of disabled people in religious tourism places because the development of tourism in Bangkalan so far has only been felt in religious tourism. Although other tourist destinations have started to be recognized due to social media, religious tourism remains a priority destination, especially by pilgrims who come from remote parts of Madura. Another reason is that religious tourism also involves mosques as places of worship that are open to all walks of life to be visited by pilgrims.

The accessibility of persons with disabilities in places of worship is additional data obtained from this study of religious tourism facilities.

The results of this study are expected to be input for all groups, be it the district government, foundations that manage the tombs and mosques as well as the Bangkalan district clerics to plan disability-friendly development. An inclusive, safe, and strong city development for every citizen becomes a development issue in the world that has been declared by the United Nations (UN) in 2015 and must be achieved in 2030. Considering the results of this study as one input to inclusive city development planning means that it has actively participated in achieving that international goal.'

2. Methods

The process of collecting data in this study was carried out by the method of observation or direct observation in the field, which is a method of collecting data by observing, recording, documenting, calculating, measuring, and recording the events that exist. Researchers make ordinary observations, namely placing themselves as observers who do not have any involvement with the object of research.

The object of study is public facilities found in three religious tourism destinations in Bangkalan namely the tomb of Syaichona Cholil, Aer Mata Ebu and the grave of Potre Koneng on Bukit Geger. These public facilities include road access to the gravesite, toilets, parking lots, souvenir shops, information services, mosques and ablution places, and other public facilities on site. In addition to observing the three objects, this study also tried to find a comparison, by visiting other religious tourism destinations namely Asta Tinggi in Sumenep and the tomb of 4 Sunan (part of Wali Sanga) namely the tomb of Sunan Ampel (Surabaya), Sunan Giri (Gresik), Sunan Drajat (Lamongan) and Sunan Bonang (Tuban). This comparison is needed so that the analysis of the data findings in Bangkalan can be more objective, and minimize the researchers' subjectivity.

Writing the results of this study using a qualitative descriptive research design. The nature of descriptive research is not to prioritize meaning, on the contrary, the emphasis is more on surface data analysis. Only pay attention to the processes of occurrence of a phenomenon, and not the depth or meaning of the data. Descriptive qualitative research according to Mayer and Greenwood in Uber Silalahi (1): The method of social research (2010) solely refers to the identification of the distinguishing characteristics or characteristics of a group of people, objects or events. Qualitative descriptive involves the conceptualization process and results in the formation of classification schemes.

The data obtained in the form of primary data, namely the real condition of all tourist destinations which are the object of this study. Secondary data, in the form of reading about the history of the development of Islam in Java, the struggle of Wali Sanga, the struggle of the ulama figures in Madura and so on are used to complete the analysis of this research.

3. Result

3.1. Prior Research

Several studies have been conducted to determine the accessibility of persons with disabilities in places of worship and tourist attractions. Arif Maftuhin (2) had researched about the accessibility of worship for the disabled in four mosques in Yogyakarta. He found that large, important, strategic and historical mosques in the Special Region of Yogyakarta (DIY) did not meet accessibility criteria, the idea of 'worship accessibility' still seemed to be far from expectations. Accessible worship (accessible congregations) refers to the American Disability Act, which is implemented with full compliance by American mosques. Accessibility of worship is a term used to refer to places of worship that are physical, communication and attitudes easily accessible to people with disabilities. Arif Maftuhin's research also found that efforts to respond to the needs of persons with disabilities were not seen even when persons with disabilities were already visible in the mosque (in this case visible at the Friday prayer service at the UGM mosque).

Similar research was conducted by Rizky Haryani (3) in Medan. Haryani also found that the 2 mosques that were the object of his study did not show any accessibility for persons with disabilities to worship at the mosque.

Slamet Thohari found that the majority of buildings in government agencies were inaccessible, making it difficult for people with disabilities to access. The research conducted in Malang also found the fact that the people of Malang, in general, are still very less permissive and less inclusive of people with disabilities. This can be seen from the view of proper education and the view of an ideal education for persons with disabilities. Malang people, said Slamet Thohari (4) more look at people with disabilities from medical glasses, namely as people who do not have perfection and therefore must be given mercy.

Another disability study analyzes the accessibility of people with disabilities from Islamic fiqh studies. Research conducted by M. Khoirul Hadi (5) concludes that the issue of disability in fiqh refers to two things. First, there is disability fiqh but it is still

vague because there is no fiqh alignment on disability rights. Secondly, the concept of building disability fiqh can be carried out through the concept of maqashid shariah. Homework about disability fiqh becomes a challenge for Muslims, including Indonesian Muslims who still do not pay much attention to the concept of disability fiqh.

The fiqh study is expected to be accommodative in providing rapid responses to disability issues. Although vaguely available, the literature on fiqh is seen as less responsive in responding to the issue of persons with disabilities in Islamic law. Whereas the Fatwa of Sheikh Tantawi in 2000 required that there be a signing officer in addition to the preacher to translate sermons for worshipers who are deaf. If examined, said Khoirul Hadi again, there are at least two important factors that make the concept of disability unanswered in the fiqh view. First, because fiqh is too focused on the issue of human needs, and not on rights that are worthy of acceptance. Second, because fiqh subjects are individuals and not institutional.

3.2. Disability and Government Policy

Disability or disability is a term used to refer to people with disabilities, activity limitations, and participation restrictions. Disruption here is defined as a problem in bodily functions or structures, while the limitations of activity are interpreted as difficulties faced by individuals in carrying out a task or action. Whereas limitation of participation is defined as a problem experienced by an individual in his involvement in life situations. So disability is a complex phenomenon that reflects the interaction between the characteristics of a person's body and the characteristics of the society in which he lives. (6) In-Law no. 8 of 2016 states that persons with disabilities are any person who experiences physical, intellectual, mental, and/or sensory limitations for a long time in interacting with the environment can experience obstacles and difficulties to participate fully and effectively with other citizens based on equal rights.

Accessibility (accessibility or achievement) is interpreted as the degree of ease that is achieved by everyone for an object, service or environment. In another sense, accessibility is a measure of the ease of location to be reached from other locations through the transportation system. Accessibility in terms of affordability measures includes ease of time, cost, and effort in moving between places or regions. (7) The ease of access is implemented in buildings, the environment, and other public facilities. Accessibility is also focused on people with disabilities to use facilities such as wheelchair users who need to be able to walk easily on the sidewalk or ride on public transportation.

Basically, accessibility is categorized into two types, namely (a) physical accessibility, covering services related to planning and development of urban areas and public facilities, and (b) non-physical accessibility, including the right of persons with disabilities to have equal opportunities in education and employment. There are several principles that must be considered in assessing physical accessibility:

1. Safety: every building that is general in a built environment must pay attention to the safety of all people
 2. Convenience: everyone can reach all places or buildings that are common in an environment
 3. Use: everyone must be able to use all the places or buildings that are common in an environment
 4. Independence: everyone must be able to reach, enter and use all the places or buildings that are common in an environment without needing help from others.
- (8)

What is mandated by the Law on Persons with Disabilities is also in line with the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) that have been declared by 193 countries in the General Assembly of the United Nations (UN) in 2015. SDGs are sustainable development action plans that end in 2030, consisting of 17 goals with 169 measurable targets. Since the SDGs was declared in September 2015, Indonesia has been actively involved in realizing them, under the coordination of the Ministry of PPN/Bappenas, and has aligned the SDGs with Nawa Cita as a vision of national development. The SDGs have been formulated in the development policies, strategies, and programs of the 2015-2019 National Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMN) which are further elaborated in the annual Government Work Plan (RKP) complete with its budget documents. In its implementation, the Indonesian government is guided by the principles of SDGs, namely (a) universal development principles, (b) integration, (c) no one left behind, and (d) inclusive principles.

In its implementation, the Indonesian government involved all stakeholders, including the active involvement of the community, represented by community institutions, philanthropy and business actors, community organizations and the media, as well as universities. The government's commitment to realize the ignition of SDGs has also been outlined in Presidential Regulation (Perpres) Number 59/2017 regarding the Implementation of TPB/SDGs Achievement and Ministerial Decrees (Kepmen) PPN/Head of Bappenas as technical regulations for implementing SDGs. This is the basis for the

preparation of the National Action Plan and Regional Action Plans in all provinces and districts/cities.

One of the Sustainable Development Goals or TPB / SDGs that must be realized in 2030 is to realize cities and settlements that are inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable. This is the 11th goal of the SDGs. This goal invites the local government to directly play its role in realizing the post-2015 agenda (the year the SDGs were launched).

The 11th goal considers the rapid urbanization experienced by many cities in the southern hemisphere of the world which has caused the growth of slums. Local governments should develop strategic spatial plans to prevent their growth and work together with local residents to rejuvenate settlements. There are seven targets related to local government that must be realized in 2030, namely:

1. Ensure access to adequate, safe and affordable housing and basic services for all and improve the conditions of slums
2. Providing access to a transportation system that is safe, affordable, easily accessible and sustainable for all, improving traffic safety, especially by increasing public transportation, by paying special attention to the needs of vulnerable communities, women, children, people with disabilities and seniors.
3. Increase inclusive and sustainable urbanization and capacity for participatory, integrated and sustainable settlement planning and management.
4. Strengthen efforts to protect and maintain the world's natural and cultural heritage
5. Reducing the number of deaths, casualties and reducing economic losses relative to Gross Domestic Product (GDP) caused by disasters, including water-related disasters, with a focus on protecting the poor and those in vulnerable situations
6. Reducing the environmental impact per capita in cities, including by paying special attention to air quality and waste management
7. Provide universal access to green, public spaces that are safe, inclusive and easily accessible, especially for women and children, seniors and people with disabilities.

(9)

3.3. Religious Tourism for Disability

By looking at the 11th goal of SDGs, especially the fourth and seventh points, the link between sustainable development and the condition of religious tourism in Bangkalan is seen.

The 4th target of the 11 SDGs stated that local governments must strengthen efforts to protect and preserve the world's natural and cultural heritage. Religious tourism destinations are usually in the form of tombs of figures and or scholars, which have been built or renovated in such a way as to become buildings that contain history. Usually, there is also a religious building (in this case a mosque) around the tomb.

In addition, the 7th target of the 11th objective of the SDGs states that local governments must provide universal access to green, public spaces that are safe, inclusive and easily accessible, especially for women and children, seniors and people with disabilities. The commitment of the regional government to build public facilities that are disabled-friendly must be questioned until the government actually builds the facility.

Religious tourism itself is often called a pilgrimage, namely the activity of visiting tombs or places that are considered sacred and performing prayer rituals at the destination. (10) There are 19 benefits of religious tourism according to Maya Tita Sari (11), namely: (1) releasing boredom; (2) eliminating the burden of thought and stress; (3) refreshing spiritual thirst; (4) reminding humans of the afterlife; (5) being closer to God; (6) adding insight; (7) increasing quality personal; (8) socializing better; (9) getting different comfort zones; (10) increasing self-confidence; (11) becoming a person who is easier going; (12) detoxifying themselves from social media; (13) giving time for yourself; (14) becoming happier; (15) increasing body metabolism; (16) maintaining heart health; (17) increasing empathy; (18) improving the digestive tract; and (19) improving sleep quality.

Conducting tourism activities in general and conducting religious tourism, in particular, is the right of everyone including disabled persons. Basically, traveling is everyone's right. In-Law no. 10/2009 concerning Tourism article 18 paragraph 1 point a mentioned, everyone has the right to have the opportunity to meet tourism needs. It was also stated that both the central and regional governments were obliged to provide tourism, legal protection, security, and safety information to tourists (article 23 paragraph 1 point a). In certain contexts, in the condition of a person being restricted by legal decisions, of course, the right to travel cannot be granted just like a normal person in general. Failure to implement this law is not only when people are afraid to travel (because of safety factors, etc.), but precisely when people who voluntarily participate contribute to development for tourism instead become 'victims'. For example, becoming victims because of terrorism, crime victims, and disasters that were born due to human negligence. (12)

As with other public facilities, facilities at religious tourism destinations should be disability-friendly. The size of whether or not public facilities are friendly for people with disabilities can be seen from whether the public facilities can be passed through,

and provide special space and facilities for wheelchairs. Some Indonesian government regulations that regulate this are Law no. 8/2016 concerning persons with disabilities, Law no. 39 of 1999 concerning human rights, Law no. 35/2014 concerning Child Protection, Law no. 28/2002 concerning Buildings, Law no. 26/2007 concerning spatial planning, Law no. 22/2009 concerning road traffic and transportation, Law no. 19/2011 concerning ratification of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. All of these regulations refer to the government's obligation to realize the City of Disability Friendly (KRD).

Things that must be considered in the construction of public facilities for Disability Friendly Cities are (a) fulfilling the right to life, (b) supporting self-development, (c) fulfilling welfare, security, and accessibility in public spaces. Accessibility can be in the form of (a) the development of an integrated transportation system for disabilities, (b) pedestrian paths that are connected with adequate zebra crossings, (c) underground tunnels (underpasses), pedestrian bridges equipped with escalators or special elevators, (d) sidewalks must connect several points such as terminals, stations, schools, markets, offices, shopping centers, parks and tourist attractions that have a flat track and a safe impression with a slope of 5% so that can be passed by wheelchair users. It is also important to provide audio-visual information media so that it is easier for persons with disabilities to know the surrounding conditions.

3.4. Discussion

For all 3 tourist destinations in Bangkalan district, all of them do not yet meet facilities for people with disabilities. Potre Koneng's grave on the Geger hill, for example, is on a hill. To reach it, pilgrims must climb the steps, which number in tens, with a slope of more than 30 degrees. Many steps are overgrown with moss and slippery when wet with rain, so even pilgrims with normal conditions need a draining effort to reach the tomb. There are no toilets on the hill. Also, no resting places were built, such as gazebos, so people rested on the steps. Information about the history of Potre Koneng was only written in inscriptions outside the tomb. The construction of the house where the tomb of Potre Koneng resided was also impressed and the place of the Koran was open, not roofed, even though it was floored with paving blocks. Specifically for the Potre Koneng tomb, a mosque/mushola is not built next to the tomb, so people only come to read the Koran, send prayers, and after that go down the hill to then leave the location. There is no separate place of prayer for women and men. Visitors cannot pray around the grave of Potre Koneng.

Another with Aer Mata Ebu. This religious tourism destination does not have adequate parking space, and to go to the tomb, also have to climb stairs. The condition is similar to the grave of Potre Koneng, not many facilities for visitors. Let alone for people with disabilities, even public facilities for normal visitors are not much built here.

At the grave of Syaichona Cholil, it is somewhat different from the conditions of the previous 2 destinations. This tomb is located inside the large and majestic Syaichona Cholil mosque, and therefore allows visitors to pray and pray. As befits a mosque, there are separate locations for praying and praying for men and women. Unfortunately, to enter the mosque you must also climb stairs and there are no ramps that can be passed by wheelchairs or crutch users as walking aids for the disabled. The place of ablution and toilet is far away (about 30 meters distance from the mosque), and as is generally the mosque in Madura, the place of ablution is always surrounded by a pool of about 30 centimeters wide as a place to wash feet. Unfortunately, the slippery condition of the pool because it is always flooded also makes it difficult for people with disabilities to reach the place. Not to mention the conditions inside the ablution place itself which are slippery and are not kept clean. Obviously it makes it difficult for not only people with disabilities but also elderly people and children because they are vulnerable to slipping.

Although there is a large parking area, because it is not neatly arranged, it makes it difficult for pedestrians to reach the mosque, the tomb, and its ablution place. Not built sidewalks that connect the parking lot and the tomb/mosque environment. And one more thing that stands out in the tomb of Syaichona Cholil is cleanliness that is not maintained. Dirty and dirty impression immediately catches the view when we come in this place. In fact, in the middle of the mosque, there are a lot of bird droppings, due to birds nested in the crystal chandelier right in the middle of the mosque. Even though a mosque is actually a holy place and there should be no impurities in it, but even the takmir of the mosque that manages the mosque and tomb do not try to drive away from the birds that pollute the center of the mosque.

In other religious tourism destinations outside the Bangkalan district, at least the facilities are more complete. In the tomb and mosque of Sunan Ampel in Surabaya, there is already an information center, monitors where audio-visual information is displayed, there are separate places of prayer for men and women. Even so, other facilities such as ablution places, souvenir markets around the mosque, and toilets are still difficult for people with disabilities to reach because the construction of the facilities does not take into account the needs of persons with disabilities.

To enter the mosque you also have to climb stairs and there are no ramps that can be passed by wheelchairs. However, inside the mosque, it looks very clean and well-maintained. Sunan Ampel Mosque is a cultural heritage since centuries ago and is maintained until now.

The tomb of Sunan Bungkul, which is in the middle of Surabaya, also does not show the facilities for persons with disabilities to make a pilgrimage there. The tomb, which is located next to the mosque, also does not look clean, although it is still maintained. Fragrant flowers and distinctive Arabian perfumes are the hallmarks of this tomb. Many pilgrims pray and perform special rituals to fulfill worldly interests there. In mosques and places of ablution, there is a very clear separation between men and women because the location is far apart. And precisely here the space provided for women is smaller when compared to the space provided for men.

Of all the research objects observed, what is interesting is precisely the grave of Sunan Giri in Gresik. This tomb is equipped with a museum containing the ancient Koran and of course the history of Sunan Giri's struggle in the spread of Islam in Java. Souvenir and culinary markets are also available and neatly arranged. Parking, special supermarkets also exist. What is missing is only the mosque building. Unfortunately, to get to the tomb, people have to climb more than 50 steps. There was no alternative but to climb the rather tall stairs because the tomb was on a hill. And it can't be passed in a wheelchair or other people with disabilities. The pilgrimage destination to the tomb of Sunan Giri is really not disability friendly. Its development does not consider gender aspects at all, both for persons with disabilities and for children. In fact, from observations in the field, many children were invited by their parents to visit there.

The tomb of Sunan Drajad in Lamongan is also the same as the tombs of the other Sunan. Although there are already extensive parking facilities, prayer rooms, toilets, and a street vendor area, to reach the tomb, we have to climb the steps. Sidewalks, steps, and facilities to reach the gravesite do not provide facilities for persons with disabilities and wheelchair safe paths.

The tomb of Sunan Bonang in Tuban, due to its sloping location, allows wheelchairs to reach the tomb arena. But facilities for persons with disabilities are also not available. The souvenir market is very narrow and does not allow persons with disabilities to pass through it.

4. Conclusion

The condition of religious tourism destinations or places of pilgrimage in the Bangkalan district and several cities in East Java, as a whole are not yet friendly. No one has built public facilities and infrastructure and accessibility to the gravesite, which considers gender mainstreaming especially disability-friendly facilities.

It seems that the ideals of SDGs can be achieved in 2030 is still a dream, because the local government and especially the institutions that manage religious tourism sites have never considered the right of persons with disabilities to be able to do religious tourism like other normal communities.

In the future, regional development that takes into account and gives equal rights to all communities must be realized immediately. That must be done by all parties so that the principle of 'no one left behind' is immediately realized.

Acknowledgment

The authors would like to thanks all those who had assisted us in facilitating the research of data, and surely our thanks also for all informants who took the time to provide us with the data we needed during the research.

References

- [1] Uber Silalahi (2010), Metode Penelitian Sosial, Refika Aditama, Bandung
- [2] Maftuhin, A. (2014). Aksesibilitas Ibadah bagi Difabel: Studi atas Empat Masjid di Yogyakarta. *Inklusi*, vol.1, no.2, 249-268.
- [3] Haryani, R. (2015). Aksesibilitas Ibadah Bagi Difabel Studi Atas Dua Masjid di Medan, Fakultas Manajemen Universitas Nahdatul Ulama, Medan. (Bachelor Thesis).
- [4] Thohari, S. (2014). Pandangan Disabilitas dan Aksesibilitas Fasilitas Publik bagi Penyandang Disabilitas di Kota Malang. *Indonesian Journal of Disability Studies*, vol. 1 issue 1, 27-37.
- [5] Hadi, M.K. (2016). Fikih Disabilitas: Studi Tentang Hukum Islam Berbasis Masalah. *Jurnal Palastren*, vol. 9, issue 1, 1-10.
- [6] Difabel, id.m.wikipedia.org
- [7] Muta'ali,Lutfi.(2015).Teknik Analisis Ragonal Untuk Perencanaan Wilayah, Tata Ruang, Dan Lingkungan.Yograkarta:Badan perbit Fakultas Geografi (BPFG) Universitas Gajah Mada

- [8] Hastuti, R. K. D., Pramana, R. P., & Sadaly, H. (2019). "Kendala Mewujudkan Pembangunan Inklusif terhadap Penyandang Disabilitas.". Constraints to realising inclusive development of persons with disabilities]. Working paper, SMERU Research Institute, Jakarta.
- [9] Yekti Hesti Murthi dkk, Mewujudkan Kesetaraan Gender, Buku Panduan Teknis SDGs untuk pemerintah daerah dan pemangku kepentingan daerah., Infid, Jakarta, 2017
- [10] Rasyid (2019). Pengertian Wisata Religi Menurut Para Ahli. Retrieved from March 17, 2019. <https://santrinow.com/2019/03/pengertian-wisata-religi-menurut-para-ahli.html>
- [11] Maya Tita Sari, 19 Manfaat Wisata Religi Yang Wajib Diketahui, <https://tempat.wisata.unik.com/> ,diakses pada 6 Oktober 2019 jam 20:52
- [12] Dewa Gde Satrya., Berwisata sebagai hak asasi manusia., <https://www.uc.ac.id/>, 11 desember 2018, diunduh pada 6 oktober 2019 jam 22:52
- [13] UU no. 10/2009 tentang kepariwisataan
- [14] UU no. 8/2016 tentang disabilitas
- [15] Perpres nomor 59/2017 tentang Pelaksanaan Pencapaian TPB/SDGs