

Conference Paper

Indonesian Translation Acceptability of Directive Utterances in Harry Potter Novel and the Application in Translation Teaching

Dwi Harjanti, Ainurvely Gehandiastie Maudy, and Siti Aisyah

Sekolah Pascasarjana Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta, Sukoharjo

Abstract

This article aims at describing the translation acceptability of directive utterances found in *Harry Potter* novel and its translation in Indonesian and classifying the steps of translation teaching. The data of this descriptive qualitative research were directive utterances found in *Harry Potter* novel and its Indonesian translation. The data were collected by using content analysis and analyzed using Larson's and Nababan's theory of translation acceptability. The first finding shows that directive utterances translation can be divided into acceptable, less acceptable and unacceptable translation. Secondly, the first finding can be used to convey the 10 basic steps of translation teaching. The steps are (1) the lecturer explained translation concept and gave examples found in this research related to accuracy, acceptability and readability; (2) students were asked to practice translating an English paragraph into Indonesian individually; (3) the translation results were discussed with their friends in pairs related to structure shift and message accuracy; (4) the discussion proceeded to determine the translation acceptability; (5) clarify readability; (6) the results were presented in a group of four; (7) the lecturer explained some cases faced by the students; (8) three chosen groups presented their works in class discussion; (9) students put forward their ideas; and (10) the lecturer and students drawn some conclusions. The translation teaching process can be done using other techniques based on the materials and students' characters.

Keywords: translation teaching, directive utterance, acceptability

Corresponding Author:

Dwi Harjanti

dwi.harjanti@ums.ac.id

Received: 17 February 2020

Accepted: 20 February 2020

Published: 27 February 2020

Publishing services provided by
Knowledge E

© Dwi Harjanti et al. This article is distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons](#)

[Attribution License](#), which

permits unrestricted use and redistribution provided that the original author and source are credited.

Selection and Peer-review under the responsibility of the Isolec Conference Committee.

1. Introduction

Translation is an important activity, result, and language art in our life, especially in exchanging information, because it helps us to know and understand various information from other languages, both written and spoken. Translation has made it easier for people to know and understand the contents of sources of information, including books, articles, documents, novel and other texts from other countries. Translation is the communication of the meaning of a source-language text by means of an equivalent target-language text (Bhatia, 1992). It is very important for a translator to be able to

 OPEN ACCESS

deliver messages into other languages, with the same meaning as the original language. Social, cultural, and historical differences between one country and another can have an effect on translation, so that it can potentially cause a change in the meaning of the original text. Therefore, a translator must have extensive knowledge, not only in terms of grammar and linguistic features, but also knowledge of the culture and social life of the community from the source language, material to be translated, and the target language.

Translation has various definition offered by various linguists but all have similar concept. Newmark (1988: 7) defines translation as “a craft consisting in the attempt to replace a written message and/or statement in one language by the same message and/or statement in another language”. According to Larson (1998: 3), translation is “a change of form. In translation, the form of the source language is replaced by the form of target language.” In line with Larson, Hatim and Munday (2004: 6) define translation as “the process of transferring a written text from source language (SL) to target language (TL).” Catford (1965:20) defines translation as the process of replacing textual material in one language (SL) by equivalent textual material in another language (TL). From the previous notions above, it can be concluded that translating includes the act of transferring message from one language to another, from the source text to the target text. The aim of translation is to transfer the equivalent message of the source language in target language by considering translation quality with their accuracy, acceptability, and readability. The examples of English into Indonesian translation result is *Harry Potter* novel series.

Harry Potter novel series, which originally written in English, contains various kinds of specific terms and utterances, which can be challenging for translators to find equivalent words in target language, in this case Indonesian. In translating novels, translators face challenges in which they must be able to convey the message accurately and acceptably in meaning and spirit in accordance with what is contained in the original text of the novel by using the choice of words, terms and expressions that are easily accepted and understood by the target readers in the target text. The translator must pay attention to the translation quality so that the contents, message, meanings, and style contained in the source text can be conveyed similarly into the target text. This can happen if the translator concerns with the naturalness of re-expressing message and re-arranging the sentences naturally in the target language that can be accepted by the readers. Accepted translation or acceptability refers to whether or not the translated text is expressed in accordance with the rules, norms and culture of the target language (Nababan, et. al., 2010). According to Larson (1998), translation will be acceptable if it: 1)

uses the normal language forms of the target language; 2) communicates to the target language readers the same meaning that was understood by the readers of the source language; and 3) maintains the dynamics of the original language text.

In translating novels, often translators do not only translate sentences, but also translate dialogues between characters, in the form of utterances. Translating utterances is different from translating sentences. The translator should pay attention to the intended meaning or message transferred by a speaker to a hearer, and the context of situation and culture that overshadows the utterances (Fitriana, 2013). There are some utterance types found in *Harry Potter* novel, such as commissive, expressive, representative, declarative, and directive. The previous similar research were conducted by Haryanti (2014) and Sugiyarti (2018). They are different in data but similar data source and type of directive utterance. The first previous study, conducted by Haryanti focuses on the translation accuracy, acceptability, and readability in general in sentence while the second research was similar on the data of directive utterance but different source language. The second data source was *The Old Man and The Sea Novel* and Its Translation.

This study focuses only on analyzing the translation of English directive utterances their Indonesian translation. Directive utterances are those in which the speaker tries to get the hearer to perform an act or refrain from performing an act. Directive utterance is a part of illocutionary acts when the speaker has an intention to get the hearer perform some acts (Kreidler, 1998: 189). There are three kinds of directive utterances: commands, requests, and suggestions (Kreidler, 1998). Commands can only be effective if the speaker has control over the actions performed by the hearer. A request is used when the speaker wants the hearer to do or not to do something. It does not assume that the speaker's control over the hearer. Suggestions are the utterances delivered by person to others to give his/her opinions about what they should do or they should not do. All the types of directive utterance were found in *Harry Potter* and they are interested to be observed. The findings of translation them can become examples of translation teaching in translation class.

Translation teaching cannot be separated with language teaching. Historically, translation process was once conducted in language teaching partially under the grammar translation method in which the learners mostly learned to read Latin text and not for communication (Brown, 2001 in Alamsyah, 2015). Many theorists, linguists and teachers agree on the importance of using translation in foreign language classes. For instance, Schaffner (1998, in Dagiliene, 2012) claim that translation and related exercises could be beneficial to foreign language learning in several cases as follows: 1) To improve

students' verbal agility; 2) To improve students' understanding on how languages work; 3) To consolidate L2 structures for active use; 4) To monitor and improve the comprehension of L2. There are some activities that can be done in the classroom when teaching translation, such as corrected close translation, word for word translation, teaching vocabulary, discussing translation problem, film shadowing and translating, etc. (Cook, 2010, in Alamsyah, 2015).

Another procedure that can be applied in teaching translation is proposed by Gerding-Salas (2000, in Hartono, 2011), which is called as Cooperative Work Procedure (CWP). The followings are the steps of CWP: 1) The teacher makes a selection of the material to be translated; 2) After browsing through the text (scan reading and/or skim reading), the students, assisted by their teacher, should identify the source, the norm, the type of text, the register, the style and the readership of the text selected; 3) The students should read the whole text at least twice, the first reading will be comprehensive and general, to become acquainted with the topic, and the second reading must be a "deep" reading, placing emphasis on items where translation problems may appear; 4) The teacher then divides the text as many segments as students in the group; 5) If the topic is already quite familiar to the students, they do a preliminary translation ("one-to-one" translation), but if the topic is completely unknown to the students, they should consult complementary literature; 6) Once the "one-to-one" version is accomplished, the students do a second version of their own translation, handling the most suitable translation strategies and procedures and being faithful in the transfer of ideas; 7) with the original text in front of her/him and being careful to follow the same correlative order of the source language text, each student reads out her/his own version of the translated text, making the necessary pauses between sentences; 8) The students, assisted by the teacher, analyze the translation strategies and procedure used and discuss the reasons taken into account in the choice of each criterion that has been analyzed; 9) The students hand in the final version of their revised and post-edited segments, which have already been amended in the light of the whole text; 10) The teacher makes a final revision, gives formative evaluation and makes comments, emphasizes findings, solutions and creative acts and analyzes failures and weaknesses in the process.

2. Methods

This study is a descriptive-qualitative research. The data are English directive utterances and their Indonesian translation found in one of *Harry Potter* novel series. The data were obtained through content analysis of the novel and its translation. The writers determined

directive utterances in the translated *Harry Potter* novel, then analyzed the directive utterances with reference to Larson's and Nababan's theory of translation acceptability. The writers then classified them into acceptable, less acceptable and not acceptable. Besides, translation teaching based on the first finding will be elaborated in this article in ten teaching steps..

3. Findings

After classifying and analyzing the data, there are two findings: translation acceptability of directive utterance and their translation and the application of the first findings on translation teaching.

1. The Translation Acceptability

Based on the analyzed data, the findings show that the translation of directive utterance in *Harry Potter* novel series can be divided into acceptable, less acceptable and not acceptable. The followings are some analisis examples of the acceptability.

(a) Acceptable Translation

Acceptable means that the translation uses the standard language form in the target language (TT). It means the translation is natural, familiar, and easily understood by the target language's readers. It is grammatically correct based on the target language rules of grammar and was not bounded by source text (ST) form and grammar. Here is an example of directive utterances in the novel.

ST: "Severus," she said in a strained whisper. "May I speak to you? It's urgent."

TT: "Severus," katanya dalam bisikan tegang. "Bolehkah aku bicara denganmu? Penting sekali."

In the example above, the directive utterance is a request that is used when Voldemort wanted to talk to Severus using this utterance "May I speak to you? It's urgent" which is translated into "Bolehkah aku bicara denganmu? Penting sekali."The translation is acceptable because it is natural utterance in target language, familiar and easily understood. There is no specific difficult term or word that cannot be understood. Grammatically, the pattern of the sentence is appropriate with the Indonesian rules of sentence. The Indonesian is also in directive expression intended to request Severus and no different meaning between both languages.

ST: *Possibly the cup of tea was Dudley's idea of a clever booby trap.*

TT: *Barangkali cangkir teh itu dimaksudkan Dudley sebagai jebakan tersembunyi.*

The Indonesian translation is acceptable, both in grammar and cultural value. No specific term used in tg=he target text so it can be easily understood by the target readers. The meaning of both suggestions are not different in message.

(b) Less acceptable Translation

It means that the translation has already been natural and used the normal form of the target language, but there is still a little problem about the use of certain terms and grammatically inappropriate. Here is a data from the novel.

ST: *"Keep your wand at the ready, Harry!" he said brightly.*

"But I thought I'm not allowed to use magic outside school, Sir?"

TT: *"Tongkat siap, Harry," katanya ceria.*

"Tetapi bukankah saya dilarang menggunakan sihir diluar sekolah, Sir?"

The translation of the direct utterance in the example above is natural, but grammatically it is inappropriate because there is no exclamation mark in the end of the sentence *"Tongkat siap, Harry,"*. It ends with comma, even though it is imperative sentence. It should be ended by exclamation mark in Indonesian, if it is not, it will be declarative sentence. Besides, the word *Sir* in the source text is translated the same in the target text. However, the reader of the target text is able to understand it although there is no appropriate punctuation in target text, so this translation can be categorized as less acceptable.

(c) Not acceptable Translation

It means that the translation is unnatural, uses uncommon term and unfamiliar to the reader of the target text. The sentence of the translation is also not appropriate with the rules of target text language. Here is the example:

ST: *"You must prune yours, must you not, to keep it healthy?."*

TT: *"Kalian harus menjaga diri kalian, kan, agar tetap healthy."*

In the example above was command of Voldemort to Bellatrix. Both utterances are different in meaning and make the expression was not accepted in the target language. The term healthy was not translated bur borrowed totally. Word prone was not translated and make the meaning di different in TL. There is no clue given by the translator that makes the readers understand it. Thus this translation is catagorized as unacceptable translation.

2. The Application of the Findings on Translation Teaching.

Based on the analyzed data taken from the translation text, the first result of translation accuracy can be applied for the examples of teaching translation. In teaching translation, the writers (as teachers of translation subject) explained the research results and applied the results in several steps for teaching translation. The writers taught translation in different classes. In each class, one of the writers who taught in that class asked the students to bring the source text of *Harry Potter*. The writers managed the class to practice translating and discussed their translation result in pairs. Students were asked to write their own process in translating text. Next, the writer and the students draw some conclusions of translation concept, translation process and difficulty in translating literary text.

For the next steps, the writers explained the concepts of translation, accuracy, acceptability and readability as the elements of translation quality. The three are very important material that should be given to the students. After that, the writers discussed in more detail about the translation acceptability and provided some examples taken from the first research finding. The students were asked to translate a paragraph of a literary work in groups. Then, they classified translation acceptability of their own translation works and proceed others' works". They discussed in a grup of three and writers gave feedback by giving examples not only from students' translation work but also from the writers' research results.

4. Discussion

Research on translation of directive utterances is very interesting due to the fact that they are parts of pragmatic intended to give commands, suggestions, and requests. Command can be used only if the speaker has the higher position or status than the addressee. Suggestion is an utterance that makes other person should do as the speaker suggested. While requests is an expression of what the speaker wanted the addressee to or refrain from doing something. This research finding indicated that directive utterances can be translated into three kinds of acceptability. They are acceptable, less acceptable, and not acceptable translation. This first finding was difference with the two previous articles written by Haryanti and Sugiarti but all supported translation acceptability theory of Larson's and Nababan's. The difference with Sugiarti's and Haryanti's was in mentioning accuracy. There is no less accurate and non accurate translation of them but there were less and no accurate in this paper. Second finding

intended to applied the first finding in translation teaching. It purposed to motivate students using the real examples taken from research finding. By giving the real examples, the students felt more aware undertood fast both in practice translating and evaluate translation works..

5. Conclusion

To produce a good translation, translators should pay attention to three elements of translation quality. They are accuracy, readibility, and acceptability. The quality of translation of directive utterances occur in literary works, such as novel and it can be measured by three indicators namely accuracy, acceptability and readability. Teaching translation will be effective if the lecturer provides students enough knowledge about it and also gives them many chances to practice their ability in translating texts and practice evaluating the translation works. Some directive utterances in a novel will be very good materials to be used in teaching translation. Some steps can be designed by the lecturer to teach translation and to practice analyzing the quality of the translation in order to produce a good quality of their own translation. Based on the elaboration in the previous finding, it can be concluded that directive utterance and its translation can be translated acceptably, less acceptably, and not acceptably. The second finding show that there are ten steps in teaching translation of three classes. The steps are (1) the lecturers explained -in their own classes- translation concept and gave examples found in this research related to accuracy, acceptability and readability; (2) students were asked to practice translating an English paragraph into Indonesian individually; (3) the translation results were discussed with their friends in pairs related to structure shift and message accuracy; (4) the lecturers divided the class into some groups to discuss translation acceptability and readability; (5) the discussion proceeded to determine the translation acceptability; (6) clarify readability; (7) the lecturers explained some cases faced by the students; (8) three chosen groups presented their works in class discussion; (9) students put forward their ideas; (10) the lecturers and students drawn some conclusions. The activity can help students in transferring the message accurately.

References

- [1] Alamsyah, A. (2015). "The teaching of translation in Indonesian context". *TransCon Proceedings*.

- [2] Bhatia, N. (Ed.). (1992). *The Oxford companion to the English language*. "Oxford University Press", pp 51 – 54.
- [3] Catford, J. C. (1965). *A linguistic theory of translation: an essay in applied linguistics*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- [4] Fitriana, I. (2013). "Translation analysis of directive speech acts in *Eat, Pray, Love* Novel and its translation into Indonesian". *UNS Journal of Language Studies*, Vol. 02, No. 02, November 2013.
- [5] Dagiliene, I. (2012). "Translation as a learning method in English language teaching". Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.5755/j01.sal.0.21.1469>.
- [6] Hartono, R. (2011). "Teaching translation by using a cooperative work procedure". Semarang State University. *Language Circle: Journal of Language and Literature*, Vol. VI/1, October 2011.
- [7] Haryanti, Dwi. (2014). "Translation Accuracy, Acceptability, and Readability of Harry Potter Novel Series Into Indonesian (Appropriate Example for Teaching Translation Subject)". *TEFLIN Proceeding*. <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/320877576>.
- [8] Hatim, B. and Munday, J. (2004). *Translations: an advance resource book*. London and New York: Taylor & Francis e-Library.
- [9] Kreidler, C. W. (1998). *Introducing English semantics*. London: Routledge.
- [10] Larson, M. L. (1998). *Meaning-based translation*. Lanham: University Press of America.
- [11] Larson, M. L. (1998). *Meaning-based translation: a guide to cross-language Equivalence* (2nd Ed). London and New York: Taylor &Franciss e-Library.
- [12] Nababan, M., Nuraeni, A., and Sumardiono. (2010). Pengembangan model penilaian kualitas terjemahan. *Laporan Penelitian Hibah Kompetensi*. Surakarta: Universitas Sebelas Maret.
- [13] Newmark, P. (1988). *A textbook of translation*. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice Hall, Inc.
- [14] Sugiharti, Sri. (2018) Translation Analysis of Directive Speech Acts in The Old Man and The Sea Novel And Its Translation Into Indonesian Sri Sugiharti English Department, Teacher Training and Education Faculty, University of Riau Kepulauan, Batam, Indonesia Vol 4, No 1 (2018) *Jurnal Cahaya Pendididkan* <https://www.journal.unrika.ac.id/index.php/journalcahayapendidikan/article/view/1284/993>.