Conference Paper

The Policy Formulation of Educational Funding in Yogyakarta Province

Riana Nurhayati, Arif Rohman, Mami Hajaroh, and Ebni Sholikhah

Educational Policy Study Program, Yogyakarta State University

Abstract

The quality of education is depends on input factors. Funding is one of input factors which still an obstacle faced by disadvantaged groups. The local government in decentralization era has responsibility to carry out education and its funding as an implication of regional autonomy. This study aims to analyze the policy formulation of education funding in Yogyakarta Province by case study method. Primary data was collected by interviews and document collection. We found that the policy formulation of education funding consists of problem formulation, identification of alternatives, and budgeting. Stakeholders used brainstorming methods to formulate problems and identification alternative. They found some problems which can be distinguished into; minimum service standard, child abuse, and education management. Whereas, budgeting is determined by conformation mechanism between requirement of the problem solving and the themes of regional development plans. So that, the problems identification and program preparation carried out democratically but the determination of budgeting were carried out by bureaucratic and top-down manner. Necessarily, formulating problem-based policy is more important than prioritizing plan with outdated problem. Then, democratic policy which organized as bottom level stakeholders participation take an important role because they closer and better know about society problem.

Keywords: Policy Formulation, Education Policy, Education Funding.

1. Introduction

The quality of Indonesia human resources hasn't been encouraging results. In 2014, Indonesia's human development index ranked 110 out of 188 countries with a score of 0.684. The following year, 2015, Indonesia's ranking declined further 113 despite the score rising to 0.689. This shows the slow development of Indonesia's human resources compared to other countries. In education evaluation, the results of Program for International Student Assessment (PISA) 2015 [1] showed that Indonesian students have low ability in the fields of science, mathematics, and reading. Indonesia was only able to rank 62 in the field of science, ranked 63 in mathematics, and ranked 61 in the reading ability of 70 participating countries.

The low quality of education as an education output which viewed from the system perspective cannot be separated from the input factor [2]. One of the input components is education funding. Unfortunately, educational costs become constraint to improve quality of education [3]. The problem educational funding is increasingly felt by parents because of the imbalance between increasing of education costs and parents income. According to National Statistics Agency, the increase in education costs every year is 10-20% while according to the Kelly Services Indonesia Survey the increase in employee salaries in 2016 is only 7-10% [4]. The high cost of education begins with high school fees. Indonesia Corruption Watch (ICW) monitors that some schools still set illegal fees for parents under the guise of compulsory donations [5]. Unfortunately, illegal fees are actually the most prevalent in the education sector [6]. At the end, education can only be accessed by groups whom are able to provide financial sacrifice.

Since the implementation of the decentralization system, as well as the decentralization of education, the management of educational and its funding has become local government matter. Local government has obligation to bring the educational quality into reality through policy mechanism. The initial step of policy process is policy formulation. It contains political activity which often be said as the hardest step. As far as our knowing, there is not much research about formulation of education funding policy. It is interested if we could analyze the process of the educational funding policy formulation in Yogyakarta as the Student Region. The formulating process could show us about the stakeholder strength to sensing problems and giving their idea to resolve them. The results of the formulation of educational funding policies reflect how much the government has committed in developing education sector.

2. Literature Review

Education is the basic right of every citizen. T.H. Marshall [6] has explained the rights of citizens in their writings entitled Citizenship and Social Class, that every citizen has three types of rights, namely civil rights, political rights and social rights. This social right began to emerge in the 19th which was marked by the development of basic education development, although in the end these three forms of rights had mutually supportive positions and interactions. The Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, the first target of the SDGs, and the 1945 Constitution article 31 have also mandated the right of citizens to get education along with the government's obligation to finance it. Since the implementation of education decentralization, the mandate of the implementation of

education also continues to be attached. The implication is that each local government has an obligation to carry out education by setting aside a budget of 20 percent.

To spend the funds, the government sets a policy as default rules. This study aims to analyze the policy formulation of educational funds. Policy analysis is carried out to create, critically assess, and communicate knowledge relevant to policy in one or more stages of the policy process [7]. The policy process referred to in this research is the formulation stage. Policy analysis is expected to produce reasonable information and arguments using one or more approaches namely empirical, evaluative, and normative. The empirical approach is emphasized primarily on the explanation of various causes and consequences of a particular policy. The main questions are factual and the information produced is descriptive. The evaluative approach relates to the weight or value of the policy. The normative approach is emphasized on recommendations for a series of future actions that can solve problems. Because the process of formulating education funding policies is a stage that has been implemented, the approach used is leaning towards an empirical approach.

Policy formulation is the initial stage of a series of policy processes. This stage determines the next policy stage because there is a plan that is ready to be applied in the implementation process. Formulating process is very important to pay attention to the situation, because policy formulation concerns the political process and many considerations must be accommodated. So that policy decisions taken from the alternatives offered must solve the problem in real or have the best impact from the many alternatives offered.

In general, the policy formulation includes at least three phases namely the formulation of the problem, the development and assessment of alternative policies, and policy decisions. The formulation of the problem as an initial step is done at least through the method:

1. Boundary analysis, is a method to limit the problem that focuses on a particular problem. First step of this method is by looking for informants (policy makers) to get a representation of the problem at hand. Further limitation can be made on a problem.

2. Classification analysis, is a technique to clarify concepts used to define and classify problem conditions. The basis of classifiers depends on the purpose of analysis, knowledge, and analytical experience.

3. Hierarchical analysis, which is a technique for identifying possible causes, reasonable causes, and actionable causes.

4. The synectics method, is a technique for recognizing problems that point to similarities. A new problem is actually an old disguised problem or an old problem might contain a solution to a problem that looks new.

5. Brainstorming, a method for generating ideas, short-term goals, and strategies to help identify and conceptualize problem conditions by involving many parties in a forum discussion.

6. Multiple perspective analysis, a method to get more views about problems and opportunities for solving them by applying technical, organizational, and personal perspectives.

7. Analysis of assumptions, techniques for creating creative syntheses against several assumptions of problems.

Alternative identification means finding possible alternatives to solve problems. The method that can be used to develop alternative policies according to AG Subarsono [8] is:

1. Status Quo Method (No-Action)

2. This method means presenting an alternative in the form of an old policy because of consideration 1) not enough funds to make a new alternative, 2) with this it can achieve the program goals, 3) can reduce risk, 4) there is no other solution that is more optimal.

3. Quick Survey Method (Quick Surveys)

4. Ways to find alternative policies by asking certain friends or groups about the problem and asking for advice regarding the solution. This method can produce a series of alternatives that can be processed later.

5. Literature Review (Literature Review)

6. This method is a way to get policy alternatives with sources from literature such as books, journals, etc. which contain theoretical knowledge in certain fields, for example education.

7. Comparison with Real Experience (Comparison of Real-World Experiences)

8. This method is a way to obtain policy alternatives through alternative searches that have been used by other parties, especially alternatives that have been used in problems that have similar social settings.

9. Brainstorming Method

Some alternatives that emerge will eventually be weighted to determine the low and alternative values offered. The criteria that can be used to limit alternative policies are:

1. Technical feasibility, namely whether the selected alternative can overcome the problem that arises.

2. Economic and financial possibilities. This criterion concerns economic efficiency (with existing resources can get optimal benefits), profitability (profit), and cost efficiency (with minimal costs whether the goal can be achieved).

3. Political viability. The sub-criteria are acceptability (is the alternative acceptable to political actors / policy makers and the public as recipients of the policy), appropriateness (does the alternative policy not contradict the values in society), responsiveness (is the alternative proposed according to the needs of the community, legal (not contrary to the law), equity (whether alternatives can promote equity and justice in society).

4. Administrative operability. The sub-criteria are authority (questioning whether the executor has authority), institutional commitment (regarding administrator commitment from the top to the bottom), capability (with regard to the ability of the apparatus both conceptual and skill abilities), organizational support (whether there is support from the implementing organization Policy).

Although normatively there are several stages that must be passed by decision makers to determine policy and also carry out the political process, but in general policy formulation can be described in three types [9]

1. Routine formulation, routine proposals that don't change much

2. Analogous formulation, the formulation of policies that treat new problems as well as policies that have occurred before

3. Creative formulation, policy formulation that treats problems through new ways that have never been practiced before

4. These three types of formulation are a general description of the formulation of policies carried out by the government. As well as describing how the government's creativity in gathering education funding policies for the benefit of society.

3. Material & Methodology

This research was conduct with qualitative approach and case study method. This approach could explore formulation activity to stakeholder in Yogyakarta which happened in the past. How formulating process and who was involved to those activity. Data was collected by interview with education stakeholders and collect secondary data about budget allocation. Data not only collected from stakeholder who involve to the formulation, but also local government leader. So we could complete and analyze our data.

4. Results and Discussion

The formulations of educational problems that have been held by meeting accommodate the various aspirations and views of the parties who feel the problems in the education environment. This process was called by informants as a hearing. This hearing involves various parties, not only from the education bureaucracy, but also practitioners such as school principals, education activists, education boards, education expert. The method used by the agency in order to identify the problem can be categorized as a brainstorming method [10]. Brainstorming is a way to generate ideas, short-term goals, and strategies to help identify and conceptualize problem conditions by involving many parties in a forum.

The problems that can be identified include:

1. Minimum service standards

    (a) Teacher adequacy

    As a result of a moratorium on the appointment of teacher civil servants, Yogyakarta is estimated to experience a shortage of more than 300 teachers. This number also does not include Special Schools Teachers which lack in competence. This problem is related to the fulfillment of the ideal ratio in the learning process according to the minimum service standard in accordance with the Minister of Education and Culture Regulation No. 23 of 2013. The regulation states that every secondary school should has1 teacher for each subject or cognate. Then, the shortage of teachers resulted an inconsistency in teaching between teacher competencies and subjects taught. It is not only felt in in public schools, but also in special schools.

    (b) Adequacy of supervisors

The lack of supervisors is felt in the Yogyakarta. The fact that it is difficult to meet the minimum supervision time standard of 3 hours/month because lack of supervisors. According to Minister of Education Regulation Number 12 of 2007, supervisors have an equivalent task with the teacher's job 24 hours in a week, which is equated with the number of schools and teachers who are coached. Supervisors have the task of supervising and guiding at least 10 schools and a maximum of 15 schools, while the number of teachers is at least 40 and a maximum of 60 teachers. Of course supervision is a stronghold in the education implementation. So, lack of supervisors makes supervision not optimal and also guidance for teachers who are in trouble is minimal. In the end, the quality of education can't be guaranteed.

2. Children violence

The violence is related to brawl and bullying. The impact can be more severe. As mentioned in the abstract written by Fadlyana [11] that children who have experienced bullying in school psychologically feel uncomfortable, self-confidence decreases and often experience dizziness. Furthermore, these effects can have an impact on children's achievement. Children who become future generations are then questioned about their role, whether they are truly able to become agents of change or vice versa. Of course, it requires great effort and a sense of optimism to truly realize human resources that can change the future of the nation.

3. Education Management

(a) Quality of School Resources

The implementation of education certainly must be supported by human resources who are able to do their tasks effectively and efficiently. The main task of teachers at school is to teach. However, now the teacher is faced with a double burden where he also has to be a school administrator. Especially for elementary schools it is no longer possible to appoint administrative staff, so double duty must be carried out. This has an impact on less optimal administrative work.

(b) Services Ego Sectoral

Co-ordination of cross-coordinate coordination in question is coordination between government organizations that have the responsibility to run the program in the year in accordance with the theme raised. The informant has said that the problem of coordination is still an obstacle to be able to realize regional development. It caused by each organization implement

their own program and there are no coordinating and integrated to their programs. Synergy and integrated program should be developed so that the implementation of the programs which proposed to realize the development strategy in the current year can be more effective. As exemplified by the informant, the ego sectoral problem in the bureaucracy must be eliminated.

The educational problems discussed in the same forum where solution alternative was indentified. So the forum is functioned as capturing problems and to receive alternative input for further education improvement. As the method used in formulating the problem, the same forum to receive input from education stakeholders is also referred to brainstorming method [12]. Dunn wrote in his book that brainstorming methods can be done in creative conferences to produce ideas for solving problems both formal and informal by involving various parties such as staff in certain fields, experts or experts, consultants etc.

This method of hearing is often referred to as a social demand approach, namely an approach that bases on the aspirations, demands and interests of the people [13]. The involvement of various parties didn't see only in terms of quantity, but whether stakeholders can present the conditions experienced by society so that the problem can be delivered and get the best solution. Of course, the identification of problems will be more meaningful as a democratic process when it provides an opportunity for representatives of stakeholders to translate their views transparently.

Based on the results of brainstorming in the form of problem identification and also filtering input by education stakeholders, then the plans for the programs and their budget are compiled. Some input is an alternative to routine problems such as the problem of child abuse and access to education for children from poor families. This formulation is said to be a routine formulation (routine formulation) [14]. The solution to the problem of child abuse is continuing the treaty with Yogyakarta Regional Police. The solution about access problem is increase the number of recipients of education assistance. The results of the preparation of the activities and the budget are then proposed by Regional Development Agency.

The proposals that have been taken by the Provincial Education Office to Regional Development Agency are discussed and adapted to the theme of the regional development strategy of the year. In 2018 the theme of the development strategy adopted was poverty. Some of the proposed programs are matched by Regional Development Agency with the education office, especially for programs related to education. Regional Development Agency also adjusted the theme of the development strategy with other agencies in the same forum. It takes several meetings to arrive at a decision, or called

the term "des". For activities that are proposed but not in accordance with the theme, it will not be decided to become a program. "Des" remind us about top-down decision making. Democratic process of indentifying problems and alternatives in previous step like cuts no ice.

Traced from the submission of the program and budget in Regional Development Agency, education agencies were only asked about program which proposed to be adjusted to the theme. For programs that do not match automatically will be eliminated. The absence of bargaining power opportunity between the agency and Regional Development Agency shows that this mechanism should be like a top-down approach where institutions at the lower level are compliant with decision level above. Although there is a hearing mechanism in the education department to listen and filter problems as well as alternatives, in the end the top level bureaucrats determine the results.

Goerl (2015) alludes to the role of administrators as appropriate not only as professionals who act as policy implementers. On the other hand, administrators, agencies, must also act as political players that they must try to solve public problems, including education, by positioning themselves as public representations in bringing public aspirations. Ideally their agencies also have the right to give arguments against proposed activities that are important to be implemented as a solution to the problem at hand (can be incidental problems). This is based on the principle that the education office is a lower level implementor who is more aware of factual conditions. So that the process of establishing a funding policy more democratic and not only an administrative.

This case is a little different when you look at the city of Yogyakarta which part of Yogyakarta regional where the flexibility of budget allocation can be determined by the Regional Development Agency. Regional Development Agency can reduce or overstate the amount of budget funds. Indeed, the city service greatly benefits because the budget absorption of funds is not up to 20% outside of teachers' salaries and allowances. Therefore, the possibility of Regional Development Agency to increase budget allocation is more likely than reducing. However, it is questionable whether the budget allocation of funds added is only as a demand to absorb the budget to reach 20% or indeed the allocation of funds added can increase the effectiveness of education programs in the regions. This phenomenon becomes a reflection again to see the achievement of educational goals in the region.

The results of program formulation as well as education funding indicate that there is funding for direct and indirect expenditure. Expenditures do not directly include budgets for educators and education personnel. Based on secondary data that can be collected from Bantul Regency and Yogyakarta City the largest budget allocation is for teacher

salaries and benefits. 80.86% in Bantul Regency and 56.36% Yogyakarta City. It make sense with previous discourse about problem in poorly education service standard, facilities in particular because of the highly expenditure for salaries.

The next budget post is for operational assistance as well as regional education guarantees. In 2018, according to the theme of the Yogyakarta development strategy namely poverty, the budget allocation is prioritized to expand access to education for children from poor families. The form of the program held was to prioritize the budget allocation of funds for education assistance through smart cards. As stated by the provincial education office that "*Yogyakarta, especially the student city,... the budget (access to education) is the main one.... First Operational Students Assistance, the second is a smart card* ". This quote shows the commitment of the local government with Regional Development Agency to open the widest educational access. The Smart Card budget is primarily a routine budget and financed by the region, to increase children's access means to have their reach extended by increasing the allocation of the number of beneficiaries each year. This certainly becomes part of the responsibility of the regional government to carry out education according to the mandate of the 1945 Constitution Article 31 (2), the ECOSOB Convention, and the target of 1 SDGs. The third mandate is the provision of basic education and financing.

5. Conclusion

The formulation of funding policies for education in Yogyakarta includes problem formulation and screening of alternative solutions through brainstorming methods by educational stakeholders. The results are taken by the education office to Regional Development Agency to make adjustments to program proposals with the theme of regional development strategies in the year. For program proposals that are not in accordance with the theme, they automatically fall and cannot be included in the regional budgeting income and cost. The formulation mechanism raises criticism when downstream implements a participatory approach then when ratification is administrative. The Provincial Education Office should have bargaining power as its role not only as a professional (policy actor) but also has a political function, namely having bargaining power to push public interests.

Acknowledgement

References

[1] OECD. (2016). Program for International Student Assesment (PISA) Results from PISA 2015. http://www.oecd.org/pisa/PISA-2015-Indonesia.pdf

[2] Suryono, S., Sumarno, Hiryanto, dan Niron, M.D. (2001). Identifikasi Profil Pembiayaan Pendidikan untuk Meningkatkan Mutu dan Pemerataan Pendidikan Dasar di Propinsi DIY. Laporan Penelitian. Pusbijakdik: UNY.

[3] Akuntono, I. (2012). Pendidikan Berkualitas Masih TerkendalaBiaya. http://edukasi.kompas.com/read/2012/06/21/14075238/Pendidikan.Berkualitas.Masih.Terkendala.Biaya

[4] Gewati, M. (2017). Kenaikan Gaji Lebih Kecil dari Kenaikan biaya Pendidikan Solusinya. http://bisniskeuangan.kompas.com/read/2017/07/17/084700526/kenaikan-gaji-lebih-kecil-dari-kenaikan-biaya-pendidikan-solusinya-

[5] Nurdin, N. (2016). Pungli Banyak Terjadi di Sektor Pendidikan. http://regional.kompas.com/read/2016/10/25/11431451/pungli.paling.banyak.terjadi.di.sektor.pendidikan

[6] Marshall, T.H. (tt). Citizenship and Social Class. http://delong.typepad.com/marshall-citizenship-and-social-class.pdf

[7] Dunn, W.N. (2000). Pengantar Analisis Kebijakan Publik. Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press.

[8] Subarsono, A.G. (2013). Analisis Kebijakan Publik Konsep, Teori, Aplikasi. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.

[9] Islamy, I. (2016). Prinsip-prinsip Perumusan Kebijaksanaan Negara. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.

[10] Dunn, W.N. (2000). Pengantar Analisis Kebijakan Publik. Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press. [11] Fadlyana.

[11] Fadlyana.. Kasus Kekerasan pada Anak Sekolah (School Bullying). *Sari Pediatri*, 8 (4), 316-321 (2007).

[12] Dunn, W.N. (2000). Pengantar Analisis Kebijakan Publik. Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press.

[13] Rohman, A., Hanum, F., dan Septiarti, S.W. (2002). Ketimpangan Pembiayaan Pendidikan (Studi Distribusi dan Alokasi Biaya Pendidikan. Laporan Penelitian. Pusbijakdik: UNY.

[14] Islamy, I. (2016). Prinsip-prinsip Perumusan Kebijaksanaan Negara. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.