

Research Article

The Role of Inter-agency Collaboration in Managing Vagrancy and Begging: Insights from Makassar City

Roihan Rabil Ahmad, Tenry Zahra Bulan, Sumayyah HR, Muhammad Nizar Abdullah, and Ilima Fitri Azmi*

Politeknik STIA LAN Makassar, Indonesia

ORCID

Roihan Rabil Ahmad: <https://orcid.org/0009-0005-1252-8667>

Abstract.

The high number of vagrants and beggars with various methods and tactics of operation remains a significant issue for the Makassar City government. Existing literature reveals that a lack of studies that comprehensively examine how this problem is addressed by local authorities. This qualitative research aims to describe the Makassar City government's approach to managing vagrants and beggars by involving all relevant agencies. Data were collected through in-depth interviews, literature reviews, and direct observation, and analyzed using Edward III's policy implementation theory. The findings indicate that current efforts remain short-term and lack a comprehensive strategy. The city's policies focus on three main approaches: preventive guidance, educational guidance, and social rehabilitation. However, these efforts require stronger collaboration and synergy among stakeholders. The study recommends enhancing coordination among agencies and implementing more sustainable measures. Additionally, while it is important to maintain a humane approach, imposing social sanction or deterrents may be necessary to uphold public order.

Keywords: vagrants, beggars, public policy, policy implementation, collaborative governance, Makassar

1. INTRODUCTION

One of the mandates in the 1945 Constitution is that the poor and abandoned children are cared for by the state. But in reality, the state is still grappling with the problem of handling street children, especially in several metropolitan cities in Indonesia. One of them is Makassar. The issue of vagrants and beggars is still a crucial issue in urban social policy that is still raised in various recent studies (1–3). Approximately twenty-five million Indonesians are still categorized as poor (4), including homeless people and beggars. Homeless people and beggars are defined as people who wander and have unclear activities with an educational status that is still in school and some

Corresponding Author: Ilima Fitri Azmi; email: ilimafitri-azmi@stialanmakassar.ac.id

Published: 17 July 2025

Publishing services provided by
Knowledge E

© Roihan Rabil Ahmad et al. This article is distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution License](#), which permits unrestricted use and redistribution provided that the original author and source are credited.

Selection and Peer-review under the responsibility of the ICoGPASS 2024: Policy and Development Conference Committee.



are not in school where the majority of them come from families who are less and economically disadvantaged(5). Another definition from the Ministry of Social Affairs states that vagrants are people who live in conditions that are not in accordance with the norms of decent life in society, and do not have a livelihood and a fixed place of residence and do not have an Identity Card (KTP) and often live wandering in public places. Meanwhile, beggars are people who earn income by begging in public places (6). Homeless people and beggars as a group categorized as poor in big cities are often victims of discriminatory practices and negative stigmatization that make them increasingly marginalized and far from a decent life. Data shows that in 2020, the number of homeless people and beggars in Indonesia is estimated to be around 77,500 spreads across major cities in Indonesia(3). Meanwhile, the latest comprehensive and detailed data is not yet available and massively distributed so that policy makers do not have a valid basis in capturing and resolving this issue(7). In Makassar city, data on the number of homeless people and beggars disciplined by the Social Service in 2018 was 195 people, in 2019 a total of 100 people, in 2020 a total of 113 people. Then the numbers fluctuated, decreasing in 2021 by 90 people and in 2022 by 195 people(7).

The increasing number of beggars and vagrants(5), especially during the fasting month, has a crucial impact such as destroying the order and beauty of the city, misusing public facilities, and disturbing the comfort of people who are doing activities outside their homes. It is this impact that presents a bad stigma against homeless people and beggars based on the unrest and inconvenience of their existence.

In overcoming the social issues of vagrants and beggars, the Makassar City government has a policy in an effort to deal with vagrants and beggars as stipulated in Regional Regulation Number 2 of 2008 concerning the guidance of street children, vagrants, beggars and buskers by using models of street children management approaches. This policy was made with the aim of creating order and reducing public unrest due to acts of violence that are often committed by vagrants and beggars. However, Makassar City government to this day is still struggling with efforts to deal with vagrants and beggars. In the implementation of Local Regulation (*Perda*) Number 2 of 2008, the Makassar City Government sets sanctions against beggars and vagrants, as stated in Chapter VI Article 51. The sanctions set for beggars and vagrants of productive age are: a. coaching and supervision carried out to prevent them from going down to public places by officers; b. taking their belongings; and c. Returning can be done by officers to beggars and vagrants who come from other regions; d. If the beggars and vagrants who come from other regions are not allowed to go down to public places, the officers can take their

belongings. If beggars and vagrants who have received guidance as mentioned in letters a, b, and c are still begging, they will be subject to a maximum imprisonment of 3 (three) months or a maximum fine of Rp. 5,000,000. However, this regulation has not been able to significantly reduce the number of vagrants and beggars(5).

Basically, there have been many previous studies that discuss begging and vagrancy in Makassar City. Thus, the availability of literature to examine the issue of homelessness and begging that is rampant in Makassar City in more depth is sufficient. This research focuses on how regional government agencies in the Makassar City Government collaborate and cooperate in the implementation of policies to deal with the problem of vagrants and beggars. This research will be answered using Edward III's policy implementation theory.

2. THEORETICAL STUDY

Public policy implementation is a field of study that is always reviewed and studied by many researchers. Edwards III states that a policy, without effective implementation, will not be successfully implemented (8). Policy implementation is an activity that is seen after the issuance of a legal direction of a policy which includes efforts to manage inputs to produce outputs or outcomes for the community. Policy implementation is an effort to achieve the objectives set in the form of policy outputs by managing inputs for the benefit of society. In the theory of public policy implementation, there are several models that can be used to explain the factors that contribute to policy implementation, one of which is the model proposed by Edward III. Edward III's implementation approach model is a top-down policy implementation, which according to this model there are 4 (four) aspects that determine the success of a policy implementation, including: communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure (9). Good communication will ensure that a policy is received properly and correctly, so that its implementation can be carried out properly and effectively. Meanwhile, resources ensure that policies are supported by various adequate tools and facilities. Disposition is an aspect related to the attitude of policy implementers in accordance with the implementation of the policy, while the bureaucratic structure is a forum where many policy implementers work to support policy implementation.

Collaborative governance is a paradigm in understanding the existence of the role of multi-stakeholders in public affairs. In other words, collaborative governance is seen as a process and structure that involves various parties beyond the internal boundaries

of the organization(10). Collaboration is used to describe the cooperation that runs between policy actors at the level of a policy. Collaborative governance has three aspects. In the first dimension, goals must be achieved with the aim of increasing collaboration to increase resources that can improve services. In the second dimension, relationships between organizations should be strengthened to gain collective benefits and opportunities for organizational cooperation. The social capital of the community will increase because of effective collaboration. To solve problems and create better relationships in the future, good inter-organizational relationships must exist. In addition, the third dimension, organizational development provides significant direct benefits (11). Collaborative governance is the right approach for policies that cannot be resolved and carried out by one party alone and require coordination and cooperation with various parties to make the policy successful. This approach has been widely applied, especially in cross-sector policies that concern broad public affairs.

3. METHODS

The research method used in this research is qualitative which can directly portray how the government handles beggars and vagrants. The qualitative research method was chosen because the context is suitable for obtaining perspectives from various related parties to understand the phenomena and policy dynamics that occur. With this method, researchers can interact directly with stakeholders through interviews, observations and document reviews that can provide richer and more contextual data. Primary data is obtained through interviews with stakeholders in this policy, including the Makassar City Social Service and the Makassar City Civil Service Police Unit and triangulating data by taking references from secondary sources in the form of reports, news, etc. related to the topic. In addition, relevant data is also drawn from previous research studies on overcoming homelessness and begging that have been published so far. These references are taken to enrich the research data and support the arguments that arise in the research discussion.

In the interviews, researchers also took a different perspective by involving several communities as informants in examining the effectiveness of the handling that has been carried out by government agencies against the homeless and beggars. To obtain accurate and relevant data, the researcher used purposive sampling technique. This technique can help researchers find informants who are in accordance with the required data qualifications, so that the data to be obtained is valid and relevant to the focus to

be studied. In addition, observation is carried out to collect data by observing a problem at the research locus. Based on this, the researcher will carry out direct observation of the current condition of vagrants and beggars and how the attitude of government agencies in addressing the issue of social problems.

4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

In describing the results of research on the handling of vagrants and beggars in Makassar City, the authors qualify based on several scopes, namely policy, communication, resources, executor attitudes, and bureaucratic structure. The descriptive explanation of the research results is as follows.

4.1. Policy

There are several agencies that work together in handling this social issue including the Ministry of Social Affairs, the South Sulawesi Provincial Social Service, the Makassar City Social Service and the Civil Service Police Unit. Based on the results of interviews with the Makassar City Social Service, which states that the poor, one of which is the vagrants and beggar groups, is a responsibility that must be taken care by the state and this also refers to the 1945 Constitution regarding the rights of citizens in obtaining education and health. In carrying out the task of assistance, there are several policies that have been successfully operated by the Makassar City Social Service such as preventive guidance, educational guidance and social rehabilitation which refers to Makassar City Regional Regulation Number 2 of 2008 concerning the Development of Street Children, Vagrants, Beggars and Buskers in Makassar City. In this regulation, it is stated that the social service has a role in efforts to deal with vagrants and beggars, among others, in terms of Preventive Development in the form of data collection; monitoring, control and supervision; socialization and campaigns. In terms of Continuing Development, efforts that can be made by the Social Service are Protection; Temporary Control; Temporary Shelter; Initial Approach; Disclosure and Understanding of Problems (assessment); Social Assistance and Referral. Meanwhile, social rehabilitation efforts are various types of activities in handling vagrants and beggars in the form of Mental Spiritual Guidance; Physical Guidance; Social Guidance; Guidance and Skills Training; Work Equipment Stimulant Assistance; and Placement (7). Preventive Development is one of the policy alternatives in the form of socialization,

counselling, campaigns and patrol activities that have been formed and operating since 2015 which are escorted by the Saribattang rapid reaction team. Where the team consists of the Makassar City Social Service which plays a role in social handling, Civil Service Police Unit which functions as an outreach for order and the Police who have a role to assist patrol activities. Educational Development is one of the alternative policies in the form of mental guidance, spiritual guidance and physical or psychological guidance. In this educational guidance, vagrants and beggars caught in raids are guided to get closer to God, besides providing motivation and changing lifestyle views through training activities is also the main goal in changing mentally for the better. The form of maintenance, sustainable development of vagrants and beggars in Makassar City is the existence of Liponsos and Rumah Singgah or shelters that function as a place to accommodate beggars and vagrants in the context of maintenance, guidance and rehabilitation after raids (12).

The coaching activities mentioned above involve many agencies, not only Civil Service Police Unit, the Makassar City Social Service and law enforcement officials, but also involve the Makassar City Education Office, Subdistricts, Villages, RT, RW, and the Makassar City Manpower Office (5). After being given guidance and social rehabilitation, it is expected that vagrants and beggars can be returned to their families and become an accepted part of society, with continuous supervision and guidance.

4.2. Communication

In implementing a policy, communication becomes one of the important factors in measuring the level of success of the policy program. The policy of handling vagrants and beggars creates a larger scope in combining several government units in carrying out handling activities. So that the concept of Collaborative Governance is considered necessary to maximize the performance of government officials. In the process of handling vagrants and beggars, of course, it involves several units of government agencies such as the Makassar City Social Service, the Makassar City Civil Service Police Unit and the Police Force. The results of interviews with the Makassar City Civil Service Police Unit stated that in handling vagrants and beggars it is necessary to create several teams that collaborate between government agencies, so that each agency sends several names that will be divided into each sub-district in Makassar City.

Coordination between teams is something that needs to be considered. This is in line with the results of interviews with the Makassar City Civil Service Police Unit who stated

that the process of handling vagrants and beggars must be in accordance with the operational system of procedures that have been formed, one of which is coordinating with the Makassar City Social Service, so that the handling of the Makassar City Civil Service Police Unit can be optimized. In addition, in the guidance and prevention of vagrants and beggars, there are also NGOs engaged in the field of child protection / social, student elements, the community, related agencies that are directly involved in various handling efforts in collaboration with the Social Service (13).

Communication channels do not only come from among fellow units of government agencies, but the community also needs to build coordination. Based on the data obtained, there are people who report the existence of troubling vagrants and beggars to the Makassar City Civil Service Police Unit through online community complaint services so that this can help the government accelerate the handling process of the Makassar City Civil Service Police Unit. Communication is very useful in supporting the effectiveness of a policy.

One of the obstacles in communication is actually faced in the process of controlling vagrants and beggars. Some of the obstacles that often occur are the resistance of vagrants and beggars when they are disciplined such as saying harsh words, being angry with officers, and beating them during patrol activities. Not only that, there are homeless people and beggars who run away during the handling and curbing process, so that homeless people and beggars do not get guidance so that they continue to carry out actions in Makassar City.

4.3. Resources

The implementation of a policy program cannot be separated from the resource factor. In general, resources are defined as the expertise to fulfil or handle something, as a source of supporting assistance, or as a means that comes from the results of one's thinking. Therefore, the achievement of the targets of the implementation of the policy on handling vagrants and beggars can be determined by the capacity of the available resources.

4.3.1. Human Resources

In handling vagrants and beggars, the quantity of human resources is something that needs to be considered because it can affect the success of policy implementation.

Makassar City is a large area that requires a lot of human resources in running the homeless and beggar handling program. Therefore, this policy uses the concept of collaboration in implementing the handling policy by adjusting the number of human resources needed by each government unit such as the Makassar City Social Service, Civil Service Police Unit and the Police Force. Limited human resources at the Makassar City Social Service can be dealt with by collaboration and multi-agency cooperation in handling vagrants and beggars.

4.3.2. Funding

Every policy program needs to get funding in the policy implementation process, as well as the program for handling vagrants and beggars in Makassar City. Based on the results of interviews with the Makassar City Social Service which states that each regional apparatus organization has competed to propose costs for each program to be implemented, but needs to refer to priority scale programs. So that the budget obtained specifically for the homeless and beggar handling program must be optimized according to the budget amount. In addition, there are anticipations such as financial assistance from the community or the private sector, so that government officials will not walk alone in handling the budget that will be used in the process of handling vagrants and beggars in Makassar City.

4.3.3. Facilities

To optimize the process of handling vagrants and beggars, the facilities and infrastructure need to be adequate in supporting the implementation of the program. At the program implementation stage, Civil Service Police Unit has a number of facilities such as Patrol Motorcycles, Patrol Cars, Mob Control Cars and several inventories to support the program handling of vagrants and beggars. Meanwhile, the Makassar City Social Service also has several facilities and infrastructure such as Patrol Cars and Social Rehabilitation Centres. The resources owned by the Government Apparatus can be said to be adequate, although it cannot be said to be perfect, but the resources owned are able to maximize the performance and implementation process in handling vagrant and beggar groups in Makassar City.

4.4. Disposition

The disposition or attitude of the implementer is a supporting factor in the success of a policy. This factor focuses on the actions, behaviour, and consistency of policy implementers in running a program. In the process of handling vagrants and beggars in Makassar City, implementers such as Civil Service Police Unit and the Makassar City Office have a consistent attitude. Based on the results of interviews with people who belong to groups of vagrants and beggars who recognize the truth of the data and state that the handling carried out by Civil Service Police Unit and the Makassar City Social Service is still fairly good and does not touch physically, but there are differences in action, where the Civil Service Police Unit only reprimands and provides guidance on the street, while the Makassar City Social Service will directly arrest vagrants and beggars wandering in the Makassar City area. This shows that in the process of taking handling actions, there are differences in procedures between the Makassar City Social Service and the Civil Service Police Unit in carrying out patrol tasks for handling vagrants and beggars according to their respective authorities.

4.5. Bureaucratic Structure

The bureaucratic structure is a unit of apparatus that is given the mandate to carry out the running of the wheels of government and is appointed by the legitimate ruler. This factor is one of the factors that will regulate the division of tasks in the process of handling vagrants and beggars in Makassar City. Currently, the Makassar City Social Service has a field that focuses on handling vagrants and beggars consisting of the Head of Division, Functional Officials, First Aid Employees, Staff and Laskar Pelangi Employees. So that the process of implementing policy programs can run in accordance with the division of tasks of each government apparatus.

In addition, Civil Service Police Unit has four fields consisting of the Peace and Public Order field, the Regional Regulation Enforcement field, the Community Protection field and the Community Guidance field. Some of these fields work together with the Makassar City Social Service and the Police in handling vagrants and beggars in Makassar City.

4.6. Research Finding Discussion

This research focuses on showing the real picture or current conditions related to the handling of vagrants and beggars in Makassar City which is managed by the results of government collaboration between the Makassar City Social Service, Satpol PP, Police and related agencies. The main findings of this research show that the policy of handling vagrants and beggars in Makassar City has been formed and based on Makassar City Regional Regulation Number 2 of 2008, but the social problems of vagrants and beggars have not been able to be handled optimally until now. This can be seen from several factors such as the handling program for vagrants and beggars has not been a long-term solution that can suppress and reduce the number of groups, but only a short-term solution such as curbing or coaching. In addition, the handling program does not provide a deterrent effect that can be felt by vagrants and beggars, so that begging and similar activities will not be carried out again after the coaching process has been given. This is also in line with the researcher's observation that homeless people and beggars are not afraid of government officials so they are reluctant to follow the rules that have been applied. Meanwhile, some of the homeless and beggars have economic reasons that continue to be the basis for their activities on the streets. One obvious reason is that handling programs such as coaching conducted by the government are not a solution in overcoming the fundamental problems of homeless people and beggars, namely poverty and economic limitations, so that the program cannot be said to overcome the root of the problem that occurs.

In running the handling program for homeless and beggars, the Makassar City Social Service and Satpol PP have followed the existing standard operating procedures, so there is consistency in running the policy program, but it cannot be denied that there are always obstacles in the process of handling homeless and beggars in terms of limited resources and support from various related parties. In addition, beggars and vagrants do not comply with the authorities during the enforcement. This happens because there is no deterrent effect felt to the homeless and beggars so that not a few of these groups dare to fight government officials during patrol activities. According to Makinde, This is important for policy makers to ensure these: 1) More focus should be placed on the financial and human resources required to implement the policy, 2) target beneficiaries should be included in the formulation stage so they may participate in the policy-making process; 3) For policy implementers and target recipients to fully comprehend the government's intentions behind a program, there needs to be effective

communication between them; 4) Unless the program is judged to be of little service to the government, the government must consider the sustainability aspects of it, and finally, 5) Sufficient oversight and monitoring, as under-supervised initiatives frequently yield unanticipated outcome(14).

5. CONCLUSION

The policy program for handling vagrants and beggars in Makassar City has not been considered effective in significantly reducing the number of groups. Some of the reasons that make this program ineffective are that the activities carried out focus on solving short-term solutions and have not been able to solve the root problems behind the emergence of vagrants and beggars in Makassar City. This program only provides temporary coaching and training, but does not focus on seeing the root of the problem such as poverty, loss of family roles, loss of motivation to work, and lack of access to education. These social problems are what need to be the attention of all related agencies in handling vagrants and beggars. In this problem, the concept of collaboration is the right method, but it needs to be accompanied by innovative policies that focus more on changing the economic and social conditions of vagrants and beggars. Several efforts offered by the government have not been able to provide long-term solutions to related issues, so changing the priority scale in handling vagrants and beggars is considered important to achieve more effective and sustainable results. The consideration that needs to be known is that changing economic factors is not as easy as changing the stigma of society through short-term activity.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors express sincere thanks to the Makassar City Social Service and the Makassar City Civil Service Police Unit and its staff who have helped and encouraged the research team to carry out the research. In addition, the research team also expresses gratitude for the funding assistance from the STIA LAN Makassar Polytechnic so that this research can be carried out as a research project for the Administrative Research Methodology course at the Applied Bachelor of State Development Administration study program for the Even Semester 2023-2024 and presented at an international conference.

References

- [1] Arpin, Agustang A, Idkhan AM. Analisis Terhadap Kebijakan Pembinaan Anak Jalanan di Kota Makassar. *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial dan Pendidikan*. 2022 Jan 4;6.
- [2] Mardiyati. Gelandangan Pengemis dan Anak Jalanan dari Perspektif Sosial Budaya. *Media Informasi Penelitian Kesejahteraan Sosial*. 2015 Mar;39(1).
- [3] Puspita Wijayanti D, Kusdarini E. Penanggulangan pengemis, gelandangan, orang terlantar dan anak jalanan bagian dari upaya Satpol PP Kabupaten Klaten. Vol. 11, *Jurnal Kajian Mahasiswa PPKn*. 2022.
- [4] Badan Pusat Statistik. Berita Resmi Statistik No. 50/07/Th. XXVII. Jakarta; 2024 Jul.
- [5] Bahfiarti T, Muhammad R. Badan Penelitian dan Pengembangan Daerah Kota Makassar Jln Ahmad Yani No P. Kajian Penanganan Anak Gelandangan dan Pengemis di Kota Makassar (Study On Handling Of Children And Beggars In Makassar City). *Jurnal Inovasi dan Pelayanan Publik Makassar* [Internet]. 2019 [cited 2024 Oct 19];1(2):43–54. Available from: <https://www.neliti.com/publications/431527/>
- [6] Muamar A. Mendorong Perlindungan dan Pemberdayaan Gelandangan dan Pengemis [Internet]. 2024 [cited 2024 Oct 19]. Available from: <https://greennetwork.id/ikhtisar/mendorong-perlindungan-dan-pemberdayaan-gelandangan-dan-pengemis/>
- [7] Ramadhani T. Optimalisasi Peran Dinas Sosial dalam Penanganan Anak Jalanan dan Gelandangan Pengemis di Wilayah Kota Makassar [Makassar]Universitas Hasanuddin; 2023.
- [8] Akib H. IMPLEMENTASI KEBIJAKAN: Apa, Mengapa, dan Bagaimana. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik*. 2010;1(1).
- [9] Sutmasa YG. MEMASTIKAN EFEKTIVITAS IMPLEMENTASI KEBIJAKAN PUBLIK. *JURNAL CAKRAWARTI*. 2021 Feb;04(01).
- [10] Dewi NL. DINAMIKA COLLABORATIVE GOVERNANCE DALAM STUDI KEBIJAKAN PUBLIK. *Jurnal Ilmiah Dinamika Sosial* [Internet]. 2019;3(2). Available from: <https://journal.undiknas.ac.id>
- [11] Bila A, Saputra B. STRATEGI COLLABORATIVE GOVERNANCE DALAM PEMERINTAHAN. *Jurnal Transformasi Administrasi*. 2019;09(2):196–10.
- [12] Marif M. Analisis Peraturan Daerah Kota Makassar tentang Pembinaan Anak Jalanan, Gelandangan, Pengemis, dan Pengamen. *Amsir Law Journal*. 2022 Oct;4(1):96–111.
- [13] Setiawan AMI, Mahsyar A, Mustari N. Pelaksanaan Penanganan Anak Jalanan, Gelandangan dan Pengemis di Kota Makassar. *Kajian Ilmiah Mahasiswa Administrasi Publik (KIMAP)*. 2023 Oct;4(5).

- [14] Nugroho AA, Azmi IF. Alleviating Society's Economic Crisis: Narrative Policy on Social Safety Nets Policy Process During Covid-19 Pandemic. *Policy & Governance Review* [Internet]. 2021 Mar 30 [cited 2021 Nov 16];5(2):113–27. Available from: <http://iapa.or.id/ejournal/pgr/article/view/443>