

Research Article

Innovative Governance in Improving Excellent Services of Municipal Waterworks in Surabaya City

Tri Prasetyowati*, Fierda Nurany, Lintang Kusumawati

Public Administration, Universitas Bhayangkara, Surabaya, Indonesia

Abstract.

Municipal waterworks services in Surabaya City are considered inadequate and have caused many public complaints. To change this situation, innovation in government services is needed. The innovation provided must be in accordance with customer conditions and complaints. Municipal waterworks, which are regionally owned enterprises, are closely related to local governments; that is why governance innovation is needed. This study aims to describe innovative governance in Municipal Waterworks Surya Sembada Kota Surabaya. This study used the qualitative descriptive method. The subjects of this study were 5 Surabaya City people who were users of Municipal Waterworks Surya Sembada Surabaya services and 3 employees of Municipal Waterworks Surya Sembada Surabaya. The object of this study is the quality of services. Data collection techniques included interviews and documentation that is analyzed descriptively. Interviews were conducted about efficiency, effectiveness, conflict, orientation, and decision-making in providing services. The results obtained from this study show that Municipal Waterworks Surya Sembada Surabaya City has carried out innovative governance consisting of digitalization of services and work systems. Municipal Waterworks Surya Sembada Surabaya City uses the CIS (Customer Information System) application to make it easier for customers to report, pay, and register new installations. Innovative governance of Municipal Waterworks Surya Sembada Surabaya City has met eight indicators, namely, increased efficiency, improved effectiveness, improved service quality, no research conflicts, public interest orientation, carried out openly, fulfilled decision values, and accounted for the results. The human resources of Municipal Waterworks Surya Sembada Surabaya City are very competent but still experience obstacles in building communication with the community. The facilities and infrastructure of Municipal Waterworks Surya Sembada Surabaya City have met the standards, but additional transportation fleets are still required. Information technology of Municipal Waterworks Surya Sembada Surabaya City services has been maximized with the digitalization of services and work systems, but it is still constrained by applying for permits to local governments, which must be done manually and takes a long time.

Keywords: service, innovative governance

Corresponding Author: Tri Prasetyowati; email: triprasetyowati@ubhara.ac.id

Published: 8 October 2024

Publishing services provided by Knowledge E

© Tri Prasetyowati et al. This article is distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution License](#), which permits unrestricted use and redistribution provided that the original author and source are credited.

Selection and Peer-review under the responsibility of the 4th ICONISS Conference Committee.



1. Introduction

The evolution of the constitutional system goes hand in hand with the dynamics that occur both domestically and on a global scale. Including the Indonesian constitutional system. The reforms of 1998 gave impetus to significant changes in Indonesia's governance system based on the concept of good governance [1].

The government in Indonesia always tries to provide the best for its people. Under constitutional powers, the government has the right to regulate and supervise society. The government is also obliged to do its duty to be a good servant and regulator for its citizens. The government carries out functions and development in various fields to realize these functions [1].

The delegation of central government authority to autonomous regional governments will help achieve community welfare so that local governments can quickly respond to community needs based on the capabilities and potential of people in the area. Local governments, in implementing regional autonomy, empower businesses owned and managed by local governments. One of the companies managed by the local government is Municipal Waterworks. They provide clean and safe water to local communities and meet people's needs in a variety of ways [2].

Municipal Waterworks Surya Sembada is a trusted and leading regional drinking water company in Indonesia. This company was established in 1976 and is owned by the Surabaya City Government. Municipal Waterworks Surya Sembada Surabaya, as one of the government agencies responsible for serving the community, often receives complaints about the services provided [2]. Based on various reports from the public submitted through Google Reviews about the poor service of Municipal Waterworks Surabaya, such as frequent water outages, yellow dirty water results, and insufficient water discharge to meet the water needs of the people of Surabaya, it can be seen that the productivity of Municipal Waterworks Surabaya city is still low, causing consumers to be dissatisfied and believe that they are not receiving the best service. This is a challenge for municipal waterworks companies to achieve maximum productivity in providing services to the community [2].

This fact shows that Municipal Waterworks Surabaya City is facing service problems, especially the lack of quality of service offered to its customers. Therefore, one of the critical concerns in realizing a competent and reliable public service system is the quality of Surabaya City Municipal Waterworks services that are able to satisfy its customers

[2]. To realize this, the Surabaya City Municipal Waterworks must innovate in providing services, namely by providing excellent service.

Excellent service means performing the best possible service to customers so that they become satisfied [3]. The best way to improve excellent service is to use new technology, such as information technology [4]. This helps ensure better governance and clean governance, as well as greater transparency and accountability.

Based on the above problems, it is known that in providing Municipal Waterworks Surya Sembada Surabaya services, it is still unable to provide optimal service for its customers. Service innovation is needed from the government in carrying out its duties in improving service quality so that it can provide excellent service by considering all complaints from its customers. Therefore, this study will discuss innovative government at Municipal Waterworks Surya Sembada Kota Surabaya in improving excellent service. Municipal Waterworks Surya Sembada is one of the divisions of Municipal Waterworks that has always innovated several times and won the Top It Innovation Award in 2014, but besides that, there are still some complaints submitted by Surabaya residents through Google reviews.

2. Literature Review

Innovative government, or innovative government, is an innovation carried out by the regional government, or it can also be said to be regional innovation [5]. Innovative governance is one that encourages, enables, and controls new approaches to managing the public interest. There is an aspect of government and a component of society, people, and citizens in that system [6]. Furthermore, the interaction between the two drives the system. In other words, this innovation is based on intelligence or creativity. The difference is that intelligence and creativity are inherent in the structure of government, not just leadership.

Previous research on innovative governance has highlighted important aspects of management and governance. Here are some key findings from past research [7–9]:

1. Governance innovation involves the development and application of best practices in government and public administration.
2. Governance innovation covers several aspects, such as institutional, organizational, process, and conceptual innovation.

3. Governments must ensure sustainability and high ambition in driving and implementing change and integrate employees with learning venues to build a better future.

4. Governance innovation affects public services, which can improve the quality and satisfaction of the community.

5. The use of information and communication technology (TICK) plays an important role in governance innovation, especially in digital village management.

Some previous case studies have also investigated governance innovations in local contexts, such as at the Tanjungpinang State Treasury Service Office [10], Yogyakarta City [11], and Badung Regency [12]. From previous findings, several conclusions can be drawn:

1. Governance innovation has the potential to improve public services and governance.

2. Governments must ensure sustainability and high ambition in driving and implementing change.

3. The use of information and communication technology (TICK) plays an important role in governance innovation.

Governance innovation affects various aspects, such as institutional, organizational, process, and conceptual innovation.

3. Research Methods

Researchers use qualitative, descriptive research methods. This study aims to find out, describe, and describe an event or piece of information. The subjects of this study were 5 Surabaya city people who were users of Municipal Waterworks Surya Sembada Surabaya services and 3 employees of Municipal Waterworks Surya Sembada Surabaya. The object of this study is the quality of service. The informant in this study is the Head of Planning and Strategic at Surabaya City Municipal Waterworks, as well as the Performance and Standardization Manager and customer of Municipal Waterworks Surya Sembada Surabaya City. Here, researchers use purposive sampling techniques, which are sampling techniques where researchers rely on their own judgment when selecting population members to participate in the study [13]. Data analysis techniques in this study are presentation of interview data and literature study, data reduction by grouping interview data, and drawing conclusions [14].

4. Results and Discussion

In the data collection step, researchers have made adjustments between the intended discussion topics as informants. Researchers adjust the formulation of the problem, the focus of research, and the facts in the field. Researchers conduct a study in advance on the theory that supports this research topic as a guideline for the results and a conformity test tool between theory and direct reality in the field. Related to the title of this study, which is about innovative government on municipal waterworks The city of Surabaya then conducted interviews with public relations, HRD, and IT management of Municipal Waterworks Surabaya, which were completed with interviews with customers of Municipal Waterworks Surabaya.

4.1. Increased efficiency

4.1.1. Digitization and automation

Innovative government leverages digital technology to automate administrative processes and replace slow, error-prone manual methods.

“For the form of innovative government that has been carried out at Municipal Waterworks Surabaya, the front office has used CIS (Customer Information System). The purpose of this application is to make it easier for customers who have high mobility and are rarely at home. This CIS can be accessed from anywhere. This is our effort to get closer to customers. Meanwhile, the back office has been used to simplify business processes, and all activities of inputting data, administration, finance, and reporting have been carried out digitally..”

The existence of innovative government refers to the company's efforts to improve efficiency in the delivery of public services and administrative processes by implementing innovation [15]. By implementing an e-government system, the government can provide online services that allow citizens to take care of various administrative needs electronically, such as tax payments, business registration, or permit applications [16]. This reduces bureaucracy, time required, and operational costs.

4.1.2. Data integration and interagency collaboration

Innovative government seeks to integrate data between agencies and facilitate collaboration between different departments or agencies. By connecting information systems and sharing data effectively, governments can avoid duplication of work, improve coordination, and speed up decision-making processes.

“So far, we have found reports from the public that with this CIS service, they feel more helped in making complaints or problems, checking bills, and also making payments because it can be connected directly to mobile banking, so it is more efficient to make payments and store payment data because currently people tend to keep archives on mobile phones rather than paper form.”

With a unified system for processing permit applications, multiple departments can simultaneously review and approve applications, saving time and resources [17].

4.1.3. Use of big data and analytics

Innovative governments leverage big data and analytics to gain valuable insights from existing data. Governments can identify trends, patterns, and opportunities to improve efficiency by intelligently analyzing data.

“For now, our party has made innovations to improve product quality, where initially the pipes used by Municipal Waterworks were pipes from the Dutch era. Starting last year, pipeline renewal was carried out, which was estimated to reach 30,000 meters. Our party also makes a water reservoir that functions as a central water reservoir that can minimize the fact that if there is a malfunctioning installation, there will still be water available that can be distributed to customers.”

By analyzing transportation data and mobility patterns, governments can optimize transportation networks, regulate traffic, and design more efficient transportation policies [18].

4.1.4. Public participation and feedback

Innovative government involves the public in the policy-making and planning process. By involving citizens in decision-making, the government can gain a better understanding of the needs and problems faced, so that the resulting policies are more responsive and efficient.

“I will feel firsthand; yes, anyway, the whole system has started to change since the pandemic. So complaining, paying, checking bills, and also installing new can be done through the CIS application. The CIS application can be downloaded through the App Store, and a guide to its use is available on Municipal Waterworks’ social media. At first, I was also cloudy with the application. I came to report about my water, which after 3 days was not optimal. Then I was directed by the Municipal Waterworks to report through the application, and the technician came to my house after my report was input into the application. Of course, this is very efficient; yes, I, as a customer, find it very helpful.”

Through the use of public participation platforms and feedback mechanisms, governments can speed up the decision-making process and prevent excessive bureaucracy [19].

Based on all the information and its relation to theory, it can be seen that the innovative government that has been carried out by Municipal Waterworks Surabaya has met the indicators of increasing efficiency. This increase in efficiency is not only for customers but also for employees and company leaders. One of them is the CIS application service intended for all customers of Municipal Waterworks Surabaya. The application can be downloaded easily through the App Store, and it has been equipped with various features for complaints, bill checks, cashless payments, and services to install new networks. Under the current conditions of technological advancement, the form of innovative government carried out by Municipal Waterworks Surabaya, in the opinion of researchers, is very good to be done and efficient for users and service providers.

4.1.5. Improved effectiveness

Indicators of effectiveness improvement in a company can be known by analyzing policies regarding innovative government that have been implemented with conditions before the implementation of innovative government in the same aspect.

“For services for external parties, yes, in my opinion, the existence of CIS includes administrative efficiency. CIS has a lot of concerns, especially about the administration. In the past, the community had to come here to fill in data before installing a new one, then employees had to survey, and if there was an error, then they had to report it immediately, refilling data, which was considered very ineffective. In addition, errors often arise because archiving administrative data cannot be precise and fast. For service

providers, we feel that performance before the CIS is a waste of time because we have to survey many times and then wait for the completeness of prospective customer data, which is usually delayed due to time constraints or the inability to come to the office during working hours. If there is CIS, all data requirements can be uploaded anytime, anywhere, and the Municipal Waterworks can survey installation.”

If the results of the analysis show an increase in work and service effectiveness, the form of innovative government carried out has met the indicators of effectiveness improvement. Measuring improvements in effectiveness in innovative governance [20]:

- a. Administration Efficiency
- b. Responsive to Community Needs
- c. Technology Innovation and Development
- d. Quality of Public Services
- e. Collaboration and Partnership
- f. Sustainability and Environmental Impact

Based on the explanation by Municipal Waterworks, it can be seen that there are improvements and increases in effectiveness obtained by Municipal Waterworks Surabaya after implementing an innovative form of government, especially in terms of digitalization, which causes all data to be paperless and stored in one big data company that can be accessed according to the needs of the company and also customers. Besides, digitalization facilitates the purchase and procurement of goods for the company.

The effectiveness shown is the success of the goals of the company practically and efficiently, which makes it easier for internal and external parties of the company [21].

4.2. Improvement of service quality

In the analysis of this indicator, researchers relate more research results to statements provided by customers. Based on the results of statements from the three customers, it shows that there is an improvement in service quality. The implementation of innovative government by Municipal Waterworks has been very good, especially in the indicators of service quality improvement carried out. The CIS application provided is very helpful in serving customers. All the features presented greatly facilitate customer needs for new installations, payments, and reporting problems. Not only that, Municipal Waterworks

also improved the products provided to customers by adding pump houses, equalizing water pressure, and replacing Municipal Waterworks plumbing.

“We make service improvements for the community, although we cannot satisfy all customers, but the benchmark of our success is the decrease in the number of reporting problems regarding the services or products we provide. There is infrastructure development for customer service to increase production capacity by purchasing Umbulan bulk water, increasing efficiency, and equalizing the pressure that initially near the pipe was high, which was far from high, so it was not even. This year’s targets all have the same pressure. This year, we added a pump house in Karang Pilang whose output is used to even out pressure.”

Service is the spearhead of the company in the field of products and services to maintain its existence in the community. Perfect service will satisfy customers and affect customer loyalty to the company [22]. The company’s increasing quality of service will also increase customer loyalty. Municipal Waterworks, as a water supply company, which is the main need of the community, certainly needs to provide the best quality service.

4.3. No conflict of interest

According to this principle, Municipal Waterworks does not experience any conflict of interest with any party. In the internal municipal waterworks, this is quite natural, but it does not have an impact on the performance of employees or the company because coordination meetings are always carried out. External relations with surrounding governments and vendors are also very well established.

“So far, nothing. The Surabaya government appreciates all the results of our innovative government. The government often sets an example for other regional agencies to immediately switch to a digital work system that is considered more effective and efficient. We are always open with the city government. The last time the mayor gave us a mandate, for example, for AMIU (refillable drinking water) and AMDK (bottled drinking water), it was because the mayor asked that it be in August this year. Of course, this is not a trigger for conflict, but we see this as a potential service improvement for customers. We immediately prepared to launch AMIU and AMDK from Municipal Waterworks Surabaya for the community. So far, the city government has been very supportive.”

The Municipal Waterworks received good attention from the Surabaya City government, and the vendor also did not experience problems, even though previously, when the system change was carried out, there were obstacles that could be overcome by mediation by the Municipal Waterworks with the relevant vendors. This shows that the innovative government implemented at Municipal Waterworks Surabaya has met the indicators of no conflict of interest that occurs. Evidenced by good cooperation within the internal Municipal Waterworks and with external parties in this case, namely vendors and the government.

A conflict or form of resistance between employees and stakeholders in a company is certainly very often found [23]. This includes the internal domain if it occurs with fellow parties or employees at Municipal Waterworks and becomes an external domain if it occurs with the surrounding government or vendors from other companies.

4.4. Public interest oriented

The principle of public interest orientation in the context of innovative government reflects the extent to which the company prioritizes public and community interests in its innovative initiatives [6].

“We always do regular reporting, ranging from daily reports to monthly, quarterly, and annual reports. The reports that we compile are entirely in the account owned by Municipal Waterworks Surabaya and can be accessed digitally by all employees. So that there is no form of fraud or corruption of funds committed by one party because all sub-directors participate in supervising the implementation and reporting.”

Based on these results, it can be seen that the Municipal Waterworks has coordinated with partners from companies or government agencies in the Surabaya Municipal Waterworks area. This form of cooperation is to facilitate if the Municipal Waterworks will carry out licensing for related parties [6].

- a. Public Engagement and Consultation
- b. Transparency and Accountability
- c. Meeting Community Needs
- d. Collaboration and Partnership

Researchers can conclude that Municipal Waterworks has met public interest-oriented indicators, starting with the preparation of plans and programs based on suggestions and criticisms submitted by customers. Continued with the process of preparing

innovative government that involves many parties and always considers the interests and comfort of the community [5]. As in infrastructure development, the Municipal Waterworks conducts surveys of surrounding residents and ensures that they do not interfere with community activities.



Figure 1: Municipal waterworks collaboration meeting Surya Sembada Surabaya.

4.5. Done openly

Municipal Waterworks carries out various forms of innovation that are openly socialized and conveyed to the community. The Party Municipal Waterworks has conducted a socialization program that is not only carried out by the Municipal Waterworks but also invites the people of Surabaya to promote innovative government from Municipal Waterworks Surabaya. According to researchers, with the making of the video, the public will know more about the use and benefits of CIS, which can then be conveyed to other parties.

“In socializing the use of applications such as CIS, we not only conduct counseling, but we also teach and encourage the public to participate in voicing. We packaged the activity in a “video competition” organized by Municipal Waterworks Surya Sembada Surabaya, with the last one in May themed on the use of the CIS Municipal Waterworks Surabaya application as an effort to appreciate water. The activity was attended by many people in Surabaya. This activity is one of the programs that shows our openness to the community. The activity is certainly followed by giving prizes as an appreciation of community creativity.”

Municipal Waterworks is very active in using social media as a forum to convey messages and programs to communities that cannot be reached. This form of activity can increase public trust because it is considered more open and always prioritizes sharing information with the community. Community involvement, even if only through monitoring through social media, is certainly very beneficial for Municipal Waterworks. Information is conveyed not only with photos but also equipped with information in Instagram captions that can be read by the entire community. With the comment column, of course, the public can respond to posts about the performance of Municipal Waterworks Surabaya.

Based on Figure 2, it can be seen that the Surabaya Municipal Waterworks has carried out work programs, including building pipes in the Krembangan area and testing pipe leak detection devices in the Surabaya area. The post is equipped with a caption.

In the implementation indicators, the innovative government has fulfilled indicators openly, which can be known from the socialization and delivery of Municipal Waterworks performance and programs to customers directly to urban villages in government activities and through social media owned by Municipal Waterworks. Municipal Waterworks also involves the community in socializing the Municipal Waterworks program, which is packaged in a creative video competition.



Figure 2: Transparency through Instagram Municipal Waterworks Surya Sembada Surabaya.

4.6. Meet the value of the results

Meeting the value of decisions in an application of innovative government is to compile and implement innovative government programs that have fulfilled the form of decisions.

“So far, we have always conducted periodic evaluations of the performance of employees. There are many programs, so the evaluation in general at Rainbank is made through performance reports; there are monthly, quarterly, and yearly reports. There are performance targets for each part. There is supervision from the SPI (internal supervisory unit) in the Municipal Waterworks, which is in charge of supervising”.

Based on the results of the study, it can be seen that the Municipal Waterworks has analyzed the value of regulations and government decisions in the preparation of a business plan. Analysis of indicators meets the value of internal decisions, namely whether, until the end of the period, the implementation of innovative government is still carried out by the initial decision on the planning in the company's Renbis. In addition, Municipal Waterworks also evaluates employee performance in accordance with the formulation of the company's innovative government program plan.

Researchers concluded from the results of the analysis that the Municipal Waterworks has fulfilled the decision value indicators shown by planning innovative government programs by taking into account the value of decisions from the government regarding binding rules for companies under it. In addition, Municipal Waterworks also periodically evaluates employee performance. The results of the evaluation are used as suggestions for quality improvement in the future and as a correction for the implementation of innovative government programs.

4.7. Accountability for results

The outcomes accountability indicator in the implementation of innovative government refers to the methods and criteria used to evaluate and monitor the results of innovative government initiatives. It involves measuring and reporting performance as well as accountability for objectives and expected impact.

“In accountability for performance results, we always do it transparently and openly. For reports made entirely digitally. For customers, we have CIS, while for employees, there is a so-called personal assistant, in which there are various aspects of assessment in the form of a report. In addition, there are also reports compiled by each section to be uploaded to the Municipal Waterworks data bank. Every month, periodically and continuously, there will be presentations on the results of the use of data and also the results of the implementation of innovative government programs.”

Researchers concluded that the implementation of innovative government has fulfilled the principle of responsibility. Municipal Waterworks has carried out activities and also kept accountability records in the form of reports on the use of funds and the implementation of programs. That way, Municipal Waterworks can be declared to have accounted for the results and the absence of personal interests oriented to each program implementation. All activities carried out by employees and stakeholders at Municipal Waterworks are directly initiated by the authorities. The reporting carried out also starts at the lowest level, namely the executive, the structural party, and the president and director.

Supporting and inhibiting factors in implementing innovative government refer to factors that can affect the success and effectiveness of the implementation of innovative initiatives by the government. Municipal Waterworks stated that the biggest driving factor is the quality of human resource performance incorporated into Municipal Waterworks Surabaya. The quality of human resources at Municipal Waterworks Surabaya is superior and supports the implementation of innovative government policies with their willingness to always update knowledge, especially when the work system changes entirely to digital. Meanwhile, obstacles from the human resources aspect are the limited number of supervisors in the field and the need to improve the communication pattern of Municipal Waterworks employees with the community because it often causes conflicts when starting construction of new projects or installations. Municipal Waterworks has made efforts to maintain the quality of employees at Municipal Waterworks by conducting scheduled training. In addition, Municipal Waterworks also plans to make efforts to improve the quality of employee communication by providing public speaking workshops to improve employee communication patterns with the community when in the field.

Facilities and infrastructure are in second place because, of course, without quality, human resources will not be able to take advantage of the facilities and infrastructure that are already available. The facilities and infrastructure in the Surabaya City Municipal Waterworks Office have met the minimum standards of an office and can be categorized as comfortable and support employee performance. To encourage success in the implementation of innovative government, especially in improving product quality and meeting the needs of the community. For people who want to submit their complaints, it can be done through the CIS application.[3]. In addition, the Municipal Waterworks also said that the location of the Surabaya Municipal Waterworks office is also one of the supporting factors for the implementation of government innovation.

Another driving factor explained by the Surabaya City Municipal Waterworks is information technology. The Municipal Waterworks Company always binds all activities carried out digitally. Everything is done without using paper. Coordination with internal and external parties can be done online. The CIS application is one form of increasing the use of information technology carried out by companies and also maximizing the use of social media to convey information to the public. Then the Municipal Waterworks also participates in city government activities every Friday, namely *sambang warga*, which is carried out by utilizing communication technology, namely Zoom meetings. The use of technology in the Municipal Waterworks Company to support the implementation of innovative government cannot be doubted.

5. Conclusion

All principles of innovative governance, which include increasing efficiency, improving effectiveness, improving service quality, having no conflicts of interest, being oriented to the public interest, conducting programs openly, fulfilling decision values, and also being able to account for performance results, have no personal interest orientation. Thus, Municipal Waterworks Surya Sembada Surabaya can be called an innovative company.

Supporting factors synergize with each other where competent human resources can easily adapt to the company's decisions and work designs, as evidenced by the transition of all activities carried out digitally. In addition, superior human resources can also responsively use company facilities and infrastructure to maximize work and service for customers. Coupled with the increased use of information technology that causes public trust in the company to increase, documentation archives can be stored easily and also expand the company's network.

References

- [1] Andhika LR, Nurasa H, Karlina N, Candradewini C. Logic model of governance innovation and public policy in public service. *Policy & Governance Review*. 2018;2(2):85.
- [2] Sari DN, Oktariyanda TA. Kualitas pelayanan pengaduan keluhan pelanggan di Perusahaan Daerah Air Minum (PDAM) Surya Sembada Kota Surabaya. *Publika*. 2023;11(2):1793–808.

- [3] Elawati N, Roekminiati S. Inovasi pelayanan pengaduan melalui aplikasi CIS 2021 PDAM Surya Sembada dalam meningkatkan kepuasan pelayanan. *Soetomo Administrasi Publik*. 2023;1(1):31–46.
- [4] von Stamm B, Robers D. Roles & responsibilities of government and the public sector in innovation – Discussion Paper for a disruptive environment. *ISPIM Conference Proceedings*. 2022;1–20.
- [5] Hai DP, Roig-Dobón S, Sánchez-García JL. Innovative governance from public policy unities. *J Bus Res*. 2016;69(4):1524–8.
- [6] Pradana IPYB, Susanto E, Kumorotomo W. Analyzing the critical factors for innovation sustainability in the public sector: evidence from Indonesia. *Int J Public Sector Management*. 2022;35(7):733–48.
- [7] Adhania D. Tren penelitian innovative government dan inovasi pemerintah di Kabupaten Indragiri Hilir Provinsi Riau: mix methods bibliometric analysis. *IPDN*; 2023. pp. 1–15.
- [8] Irianto H, Ratnawati S, Hartin J. Inovasi layanan kependudukan Dpendukcapil melalui program jemput bola terpadu di Kabupaten Sidoarjo. *Jurnal Administrasi Publuk dan Ilmu Komunikasi*. 2022;9(2):145–50, <https://doi.org/10.55499/intelektual.v9i2.81>
- [9] Nurany F. Best practice policy: the effectiveness of natural gas line program in Lontong Neighborhood Surabaya. *SOSHUM: Jurnal Sosial Dan Humaniora*. 2023;13(2):120–30.
- [10] Rizal HS. Inovasi pelayanan pengurusan paspor di Kantor Imigrasi Kelas II Tanjung Pinang Balai Karimun Provinsi Riau. Universitas Islam Riau; 2019.
- [11] Novriando A, Purnomo EP, Salsabila L. Efektivitas “Jogja Smart Service” terhadap pelayanan publik di Kota Yogyakarta. *Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan*. 2020;13(2):68–75.
- [12] Putu N, Sari M, Supriyanti NW, Yudharta IPD. Innovative governance dalam pengelolaan desa digital (studi kasus: Desa Punggul, Kecamatan Abiansemal, Kabupaten Badung). *Jurnal Administrasi Publik. Citizen Charter*. 2022;2(1):1–15.
- [13] Creswell JW. Penelitian kualitatif dan desain riset (memilih diantara lima pendekatan). *Penelitian Kualitatif*; 2015.
- [14] Miles MB, Huberman AM, Salda na J. *Qualitative data analysis, a methods sourcebook*. 3rd ed. California: SAGE Publications, Inc.; 2014.
- [15] Sudrajat A, Andhika L. Empirical evidence governance innovation in public service. *Jurnal Bina Praja*. 2021;13(3):407–17.
- [16] Budi NFA, Fitriani WR, Hidayanto AN, Kurnia S, Inan DI. A study of government 2.0 implementation in Indonesia. *Socioecon Plann Sci*. 2020;72:100920.

- [17] Kanaan A, AL-Hawamleh A, Abulfaraj A, Al-Kaseasbeh HM, Alorfi A. The effect of quality, security and privacy factors on trust and intention to use e-government services. *International Journal of Data and Network Science*. 2023;7(1):185–98.
- [18] Chantillon M, Crompvoets J, Peristeras V. Prioritizing public values in e-government policies: a document analysis. *Inf Polity*. 2020;25(3):275–300.
- [19] Ortiz T. Social media in e-government: social media utilization by municipal governments to enhance transparency, participation and collaboration among all generations of users. University of La Verne; 2020.
- [20] Wahyudi A. Problematizations of organizational reform policy at National Institute of Public Administration, Republic of Indonesia. *Public Policy Adm Res*. 2016;6(9):37–46.
- [21] Maesaroh S, Lubis RR, Husna LN, Widyaningsih R, Susilawati R, Yasmin PM. Efektivitas implementasi manajemen business intelligence pada industri 4.0. *ADI Bisnis Digital Interdisiplin Jurnal*. 2022;3(2):69–75.
- [22] Mafruhah M, Aisyah RHS, Anindyaputri FZ, Irianto H. The implementation of principle of accuracy as a test stone for state administrative decisions. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute-Journal (BIRCI-Journal)*. 2021 Oct;4(4):8445–55.
- [23] Fadeli M, Wardhani TF, Setiawan A. Semiotika kampanye politik melalui papan reklame. *Jurnal Ilmiah Manajemen Informasi dan Komunikasi*. 2022;6(1).