

## Research Article

# Collaborative Governance in Handling Limited Face-to-face Learning Cases of Corona Virus in Elementary Schools in Bekasi Regency Case Study: Education Office and Health Office of Bekasi Regency Government

Kalis Endah Wahyuni

Politeknik STIA LAN Jakarta

**ORCID**Kalis Endah Wahyuni: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4283-3161>**Abstract.**


This study aims to examine how the application of the concept of collaborative governance is carried out by the Bekasi Regency government by involving the Education Office and Health Office to handle the limited face-to-face learning of COVID-19 in the Bekasi Regency elementary school environment. This type of research uses a qualitative approach. This qualitative research method was chosen so that researchers can describe or understand an event that occurred to the researcher being studied. This study uses a descriptive type, research conducted to determine the points of independent variables, either one or more variables without making comparisons between one variable and another in the form of events or symptoms experienced directly by the researcher and based on the results of the researcher's observations. The results of the study show 1) Face-to-face dialogue: there is no definite schedule regarding when meetings are held, and in handling face-to-face learning limited to COVID-19 for elementary schools in Bekasi Regency, there are obstacles so that communication cannot be carried out optimally. 2) Trust building: the actors involved have shown mutual acceptance toward the membership of the collaboration participants that have been determined previously, and the local government, those involved, already have tupoksi in accordance with their respective authorities and abilities. And openness or transparency in collaborative activities cannot be said to be good. 3) Commitment to the process: each service as a whole has contributed and has an awareness that solving this pandemic problem cannot be done by one group alone but must be done together. 4) Shared understanding: collaborating parties have been able to identify problems that are one of the inhibiting factors in collaborative activities. 5) Intermediated outcome: in the application of collaboration, the results have not been very satisfactory.

**Keywords:** Covid-19, limited face-to-face learning, collaborative governance, Bekasi Regency

Corresponding Author: Kalis Endah Wahyuni; email: [kalisend.ananthakuantha@gmail.com](mailto:kalisend.ananthakuantha@gmail.com)

**Published** 21 June 2023

**Publishing services provided by**  
**Knowledge E**

 Kalis Endah Wahyuni. This article is distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution License](#), which permits unrestricted use and redistribution provided that the original author and source are credited.

Selection and Peer-review under the responsibility of the ICoGPASS Conference Committee.

 OPEN ACCESS

## 1. INTRODUCTION

Since 2019, the virus that originated in Wuhan, China, namely Covid-19, which was designated as a pandemic by the *World Health Organization* (WHO), has opened up the world in a new way. This virus paralyzes human activities, from health attacks to paralyzing social activities (Anis, Heri Susanto and Fathurrahman, 2021:61). Based on the policy of Presidential Decree No. 12 of 2022 regarding Covid-19 as a national non-natural disaster, the Disaster Management Agency (BNPB) imposed an emergency response period of Covid-19 for 91 days, from February 29, 2020 to May 29, 2020 (Nugrahey, 2020 in Vicky, Ahmad et al: 2021). Meanwhile, based on Law Number 20 of 2003 concerning the National Education System article (3) which states that "National education functions to develop capabilities and shape the character and civilization of a dignified nation in the context of educating the nation's life, aiming at developing the potential of students to become human beings of faith. and fear God Almighty, have noble character, are healthy, knowledgeable, capable, creative, independent and become democratic and responsible citizens. This is also written in the preamble to the 1945 Constitution, namely educating the nation's life which is one of the national ideals and functions of the state (state government system).

In response to this policy, the Ministry of Education, Culture, Research and Technology issued a Joint Decree of the Minister of Education, Culture, Research and Technology, the Minister of Religion, the Minister of Health, and the Minister of Home Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Number 05/KB/2021, Number 1347 of 2021. , Number HK.01.08/MENKES/ 6678/2o21, Number 443-5847 of 2021 concerning Guidelines for Implementation of Learning During the *Corona Virus Disease* 2019 (Covid-19) Pandemic, namely, assigning a task force to handle COVID-19 starting from the kelurahan/village level, sub-district and district/city and/or school/madrasah health business development team (UKS/M) at district/city/provincial level in accordance with their authority to foster and monitor the implementation of health protocols during limited face-to-face learning. This means that the local government/Head of Region/Regional Education Office together with the Health Office must supervise and provide guidance on the implementation of face-to-face learning, by ensuring strict implementation of health protocols by education units, conducting behavioral surveys of compliance with health protocols to accelerate Covid-19 vaccination for students who have met the requirements as recipients of the Covid-19 vaccine and report it.

The Ministry of Education, Culture, Research and Technology also created a School Activity Business Revitalization (UKS) program through Healthy Schools to create

healthy, strong and intelligent Indonesian children with character. To realize the UKS Revitalization through Healthy Schools, there are five targets involved, namely elementary schools throughout Indonesia, educators and education staff, UKS coaching and implementing teams, parents, and the community. In this case, the UKS coaching and implementing team is the local education office and health office.

The Health Office is an agency engaged in health services that provides information needs, as well as health services needed or needed by the community. The function of the Health Service is to carry out regional government affairs in the health sector based on the nature of autonomy and assist in carrying out operational technical tasks in the health sector related to the development and development of preventive health services, eradication of infectious diseases and environmental health, family health, pharmaceutical services and food and beverage supervision. as well as program development based on the policy of the Regional Head/Regent of Bekasi Regency.

Meanwhile, the Education Office is the implementing element of the Regional Government which is led by a Head of Service who is under and responsible to the Regent through the Regional Secretary. In this case, based on Regent Regulation No. 55 of 2016 concerning the Position, Organizational Structure, Duties and Functions and Work of the Bekasi Regency Education Office, that in the Elementary School Development Sector it is led by a Head of Division and has three main points of leading, planning, organizing, organizing and controlling the field of Elementary School Development.

From this description, in supporting the implementation of Limited Face-to-Face Learning in Primary Schools in Bekasi Regency, through efforts to foster, supervise, ensure and report all forms of activities related to the implementation of health protocols and building UKS in all primary school education units in Bekasi Regency. Based on the author's observations, various problems were found in *Collaborative Governance* implemented by the Education Office and the Bekasi District Health Office, such as; The lack of supervision carried out by the Health Office during coaching related to the appeal for health protocols in schools and the lack of good communication between the Education Office and the Health Office, causing some schools to experience delays for face-to-face learning limited to elementary schools in Bekasi Regency.

Meanwhile, the concept of *Collaborative Governance* itself includes the participation of all organizations that initiate collaborative efforts and initiatives in the form of the contribution of each stakeholder to determine/set goals, evaluate results, bring about change, etc. related to the goals of the collaboration. (Sudarmo: 2017).

Ansell & Gash (2007: 543) revealed that *collaborative governance* become a tactic new in governance good create various policy makers gathered on forum the same

to make create a consensus . Furthermore, Ansell & Gash define *collaborative governance* is arrangement governance in which one or more public institutions personally involve non-governmental actors in policy-making process a formal, consensus-oriented, consultative collective using the goal to create or implement public policies, manage programs or public assets.

The definition based on Ansell & Gash (2007: 5) emphasizes six criteria. First, the institution was initiated by the public institution. Second, participants in institution just now must include non-governmental actors. Third, participants must involved personally in policy making and not just “consulting” with the government. Fourth, institutions must be formally organized and have meetings regular. Fifth, the policies are taken mandatory of consensus. And sixth, cooperation are you serious in public policy or public management (Ansell & Gash, 2007: 544).

*Collaborative governance* is an instrument that worn as solving a case. *Collaborative governance* is an instrument that perfect to confront using case, because *collaborative governance* establish “common ownership” of the case earlier. Various actors have perspectives different out of tune on seeing a problem. Not a thing easy make it easy to form an understanding between the participating actors. *Collaborative governance* acts as a mediator so actors can formulate a common understanding that of a case (Ansell, 2014: 172). Therefore, this study aims to examine how the application of the *Collaborative Governance* is carried out by the Bekasi Regency government by involving the Education Office and Health Office in an effort to handle limited face-to-face learning from Covid-19 in the Bekasi Regency elementary school environment.

## 2. RESEARCH METHODS

This research was conducted at the Bekasi District Health Office and Education Office in West Java Province. This type of research uses a qualitative approach, this qualitative research method was chosen so that researchers can describe or understand an event that occurred in the researcher being studied. This study uses a descriptive type, research conducted to determine the points of independent variables, either one or more variables without making comparisons between one variable and another in the form of events or symptoms experienced directly by the researcher and based on the results of the researcher’s observations. The data studied are in the form of several government policies such as; 1) Law Number 20 of 2003 concerning the National Education System. 2) Joint Decree of the Minister of Education, Culture, Research and Technology, Minister of Religion, Minister of Health, and Minister of Home Affairs

of the Republic of Indonesia Number 05/KB/2021, Number 1347 of 2021, Number HK.01.08/MENKES/6678/2021, Number 443-5847 of 2021 concerning Guidelines for the Implementation of Learning During the Kemendikbudristek Elementary Schools. Corona Virus Disease 2019 (Covid- 19) Pandemic, 3) Regent Regulation Number 55 of 2016 concerning Position, Organizational Structure, Duties and Functions and Work of the Bekasi Regency Education Office, 4) Guidebook Implementation of Reproductive Health Education in Elementary Schools from Kemendikbudristek, 5) UKS Governance Guidelines in Kemendikbudristek Elementary Schools.

### 3. EXPLANATION

In overcoming problems related to the handling of limited face-to-face learning Covid-19 in Bekasi Regency elementary schools. In this case, the form of cooperation carried out by the Bekasi Regency government is through the Education Office and the Bekasi Regency Health Office. In this study, using the collaborative model of Chris Ansell and Alison Gas (2017), which applies five variables as follows;

#### 3.1. Face To Face Dialogue:

1. (a) **Routine Communication:** for routine meetings as a form of dialogue between schools and the education and health offices there is no fixed schedule. However, based on what the researcher experienced as an actor of this collaboration, the scale of the meetings that are held is quite routine every week through face-to-face dialogue (in person) or *online* considering the difficulty of face-to-face activities during the pandemic. It can be concluded that, there is no definite schedule regarding when the meeting will be held.
- (b) **Meeting Quality:** In an open, critical socialization meeting and a joint decision-making process, the communication developed was quite good. However, in the collaborative activities of actors in handling limited face-to-face learning of COVID-19 for elementary schools in Bekasi Regency, there are obstacles so that communication cannot be carried out optimally. Where the researchers found that not all of these actors were included in activities or meetings that were carried out directly in the field. For example, the lack of good direct involvement from the health office related to the implementation of health protocols and UKS development in elementary school units in Bekasi Regency.

### 3.2. Trust Building :

1. (a) **Mutual Acceptance:** It is known that the actors involved in handling the limited face-to-face learning of COVID-19 for elementary schools in Bekasi Regency have shown mutual acceptance of the membership of the collaboration participants that have been previously determined. Then there are also no problems related to the membership. It is proven by the respective education and health offices that have carried out their main duties and functions.
- (b) **Responsibility:** Responsibility is a form of support for each actor by being involved in its implementation, being responsible for decisions and actions that have been made. Local government Those involved in handling face-to-face learning limited to COVID-19 for elementary schools in Bekasi Regency already have tupoksi in accordance with their respective authorities and abilities.
- (c) **Transparency:** In the implementation of collaboration, it is very important to have openness or transparency. In the collaboration of actors handling limited face-to-face learning of COVID-19 for elementary schools in Bekasi Regency regarding openness or transparency in collaborative activities, it cannot be said to be good. Because so far this indicator of openness only exists within the scope of their respective offices. Which then only accepts decisions made by regional heads.

### 3.3. Commitment To The Process

The concept of collaboration is based on the encouragement for people to work or be involved as a contribution action in each field or in this case its relation to local government services in accordance with the capacity or main tasks and functions of each service. Through the role of the education office and health office involved in handling face-to-face learning limited to COVID-19 for elementary schools in Bekasi Regency. The government is required to always take part in the tasks that have been mutually agreed upon.

The researcher concludes that each department as a whole has contributed to the handling of limited face-to-face learning of COVID-19 in Bekasi Regency elementary schools, either directly or indirectly. And each party also has the awareness that solving this pandemic problem cannot be done by one group alone but must be done together.

### 3.4. Shared Understanding

In terms of actor collaboration in handling face-to-face learning limited to covid-19 in elementary schools in Bekasi Regency, the objectives are: fostering, ensuring, supervising and reporting in terms of basic education units to prepare strict health protocols to building UKS to improve preparedness and ability to prevent, detect and respond to COVID-19.

Furthermore, the understanding of the education office and the health office regarding general problems has been said to be one perception. Where the problems related to the handling of limited face-to-face learning of covid-19 in Bekasi Regency elementary schools generally stem from the low knowledge and information and awareness of elementary schools related to covid-19. So it can be concluded that the collaborating parties have been able to identify problems that are one of the inhibiting factors in collaborative activities.

### 3.5. Intermediated Outcome

In order to achieve the objectives of the existing government policies related to limited face-to-face learning, the concept of collaboration will continue with the application of collaboration that shows evidence through the success of small activities carried out from the concept. In the application of actor collaboration in handling the limited face-to-face learning of COVID-19 at elementary schools in Bekasi Regency, it has not shown satisfactory results. However, several parties admit that the involvement of many actors in the implementation of this concept makes it easier to solve problems related to the pandemic that occurred in Bekasi Regency.

## 4. CONCLUSION

### 4.1. Face To Face Dialogue :

1. (a) Routine Communication: It can be concluded that, there is no definite schedule regarding when the meeting is held.
- (b) Quality of Meetings: In collaborative activities of actors in handling limited face-to-face learning of COVID-19 for elementary schools in Bekasi Regency, there are obstacles so that communication cannot be carried out optimally.

## 4.2. Trust Building :

1. (a) Mutual Acceptance: It can be seen that the actors involved in handling the limited face-to-face learning of COVID-19 for elementary schools in Bekasi Regency have shown mutual acceptance towards the membership of the collaboration participants that have been determined previously.
- (b) Responsibility: Local government Those involved in handling face-to-face learning limited to COVID-19 for elementary schools in Bekasi Regency already have tupoksi in accordance with their respective authorities and abilities.
- (c) Transparency: In the collaboration of actors handling limited face-to-face learning of COVID-19 for elementary schools in Bekasi Regency regarding openness or transparency in collaborative activities it cannot be said to be good.

## 4.3. Commitment To The Process

Each department as a whole has contributed to the handling of limited face-to-face learning of COVID-19 in Bekasi Regency elementary schools, either directly or indirectly. And each party also has the awareness that solving this pandemic problem cannot be done by one group alone but must be done together.

## 4.4. Shared Understanding

Collaborating parties have been able to identify problems that are one of the inhibiting factors in collaborative activities.

## 4.5. Intermediated Outcome

In the application of actor collaboration in handling the limited face-to-face learning of COVID-19 at elementary schools in Bekasi Regency, it has not shown satisfactory results.

Based on the research findings, a number of recommendations were then formulated for the realization of the goals of the program. The recommendations include:

1. There needs to be firmness regarding the existence of each department and school involved in the collaboration.



2. It is necessary to make a SK for specific duties and functions and issued directly by the regional head or the Regent of Bekasi Regency as a whole for each service, so that every service involved has a sense of responsibility.
3. There is a supervisory team in increasing the participation of each service by actively involving the service
4. A systematic agenda is created in the collaboration for handling limited face-to-face learning from Covid-19 in Bekais Regency elementary schools, so that all elementary school units can develop evenly .
5. Sufficient funding and infrastructure are needed to support the raw materials for the fulfillment of health protocols and the construction of UKS for elementary school units in Bekasi Regency, thus supporting the smoothness of limited face-to-face learning.

## References

- [1] Ansell C, Gash A. Collaborative governance in theory and practice. *J Public Adm Res Theory*. 2007;18(4):543–571.
- [2] Asropi, Annisa, Maria. Collaborative governance model in Indonesian innovation startup program: The Maskit Startup Case Study. *Adm Sci*. 2022;20(1):2615–7268.
- [3] Gitsham M, Page N. Designing effective multi-stakeholder collaborative platforms: Learning from the experiance of the UN Global Compact LEAD Initiative. *SAM Advanced Management Journal-Autumn 2014*. 2014.
- [4] Joint Decree of the Minister of Education, Culture, Research and Technology, Minister of Religion, Minister of Health, and Minister of Home Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Number 05/KB/2021, Number 1347 of 2021, Number HK.01.08/MENKES/6678/2o21, Number 443- 5847 of 2021 concerning Guidelines for the Implementation of Learning During the Corona Virus Disease 2019 (Covid-19) Pandemic.
- [5] Minister of Education, Culture, Research, and Technology concerning Guidelines for the Implementation of Reproductive Health Education in Elementary Schools.
- [6] Minister of Education, Culture, Research, and Technology concerning UKS Governance Guidelines in Elementary Schools.
- [7] Regent Regulation Number 55 of 2016 concerning Position, Organizational Structure, Duties and Functions and Work of the Bekasi Regency Education Office.

- [8] Roni T, et al. Collaborative governance in handling the spread of corona virus disease-19 cases in the City of Padang. *J Nat Conf Admin Sci.* 2020;4(0):133–137.
- [9] Septiani A. Policy analysis of School Health Business (UKS) in the Bantul Regency Basic Education Office. *J Educ Policy.* 2016;7(5):721–31.
- [10] Sugiyono. Administrative research methods, ALFABETA, cv. Bandung Annual Plan of the Banjarmasin City Health Office 2019. 2012.
- [11] Law Number 20 of 2003 concerning the National Education System.
- [12] Vicky A, et al. Collaborative Governance in Covid-19 Handling Case Study: Yogyakarta Special Region Government and Muhammadiyah Covid-19 Command Center. *J Govt Sci.* 2021;6(02):247–264.
- [13] WHO Director-General's opening remarks at the media briefing on COVID-19. <https://www.who.int/director-general/speeches/detail/who-director-general-s-opening-remarks-at-the-media-briefing-on-covid-19> 11-march- 2020. Retrieved 2022-09-18. 2020.